

## CHAPTER IV

### RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter presents the collected data from students' English translation method and the analysis of it. The grammatical transfers are showed as research findings. Furthermore, the analyzed data is categorized based on the types of grammatical transfer in discussion part. Finally, the structural factors are figured out based on the following findings and discussion.

#### A. Research Findings

Following the analyzed data, amount of positive and negative transfers in grammar occur in students' English translation. Theories related to English grammar and Indonesian language rules are used as the guidance in examining students' sentences, clauses and phrases. The researcher explores the findings in detail; in these following tables, the Indonesian sentences from the Indonesian text and the students' English translations are showed; those consist of the list of the grammatical transfers. Furthermore, the brief explanation below the table is the researcher's analysis.



b. *Is*

<i>Dengan demikian, Islamic Studies merupakan generasi kedua tradisi kajian Islam ...</i>	Accordingly, Islamic Studies <b>is</b> a second-generation tradition of Islamic studies ...
---	---

Principally, Indonesian language does not have ‘to be’ in any sentence construction. Besides, different from “is”, which is an auxiliary verb and principal verb denoting existence in English pattern<sup>1</sup>; the category of “*merupakan*” is ‘*kata penghubung*’ (conjunction) in Indonesian sentence structure. Practically, it is responsible for describing something; this is also one of the responsibilities of ‘to be’. Additionally, “*merupakan*” have a function as a predicate in the sentence.

c. *After*

<i>..., setelah Edward Said menulis buku Orientalism.</i>	..., <b>after</b> Edward Said wrote a book <i>Orientalism</i> .
---	---

It is assumedly right that the facilitation cases in this translated text are mostly because of the lexical meaning of the words. However, in Indonesian language and English, words’ functions, categories, and

<sup>1</sup> C.E. Eckersley, *A Concise English Grammar for Foreign Students*. (London: Longmans, 1958), p. 75.

positions are typically different; therefore when facilitation occur caused by word's lexical meaning; it is not simply a semantic transfer. For instance, in the clause above; “*setelah*”, in Indonesian language, has a function as ‘*kata penghubung*’ (conjunction); it is the same as the word ‘after’ in this sentence. Those connect two clauses and explain about a time which is later than another event. Thus, the students were possibly facilitated by Indonesian language grammar in constructing this clause.

d. *In, Or*

..., <i>kajian-kajian tentang Islam</i> <b><u>di</u></b>	..., studies on Islam <b>in</b>
<b><i>Jerman</i></b> <b><u>atau</u></b> <b><i>Eropa</i></b> <b><u>pada</u></b>	<b>Germany or Europe</b> in general
<i>umumnya, lebih memillih untuk</i>	prefer to ...

Basically, English and Indonesian language have similarity in organizing the order of prepositional phrase; the preposition is positioned before noun. For example, the prepositional phrase above shows that both prepositions are before the noun. It is different from Japanese language's preposition which is positioned after noun. In addition, the word “*atau*” is also a conjunction in Indonesian language; which exactly has the same position as conjunction “or” in English.

e. *That*

<i>Namun demikian perlu juga diketahui bahwa objek studi orientalisme Jerman ...</i>	But it is important also known <b>that</b> the object of study Orientalism German ...
--	---

The sentence above shows similarity of pattern in part of sentence between Indonesian language and English. “That” in English is a subordinating conjunction which joins subordinate clause to the main clause. Likewise, “*bahwa*” is also a conjunction that unites subordinate clause (*anak kalimat*) to the main clause (*induk kalimat*); orders of the words are the same. This can considerably facilitate the students in translating the sentence correctly.

f. *Which*

<i>Dengan demikian, konsep orientalisme awal dalam tradisi orientalisme Jerman adalah orientalisme yang mengkaji, sebagaimana diungkap oleh Suzanne Marchand, ...</i>	Accordingly, the concept of Orientalism early in the tradition of German Orientalism is orientalism <b>which</b> examines, as revealed by Suzanne Marchand, ...
---	---

The word “*yang*” above stands for conjunction in Indonesian language system; while “which” is a relative pronoun. Besides, the

characteristics are also different; ‘which’ is used for things and animals, in contrast, there is no difference in using ‘yang’ to link phrases in a sentence. However, the function in sentence might be the same; both “yang” and “which” construct clause that explain subject, object of verb, and object of preposition. The position of the word that is before the constructed clause also helps students to guess the right pattern.

g. *That*

<i>Kajian-kajian ini menjadi bagian dari wacana orientalisme yang berkembang di Jerman ...</i>	These studies became part of the discourse of orientalism <b>that</b> developed in Germany ...
--	--

The sentence in the table above is exactly the same as the sentence before. ‘That’ and ‘which’ have the same function, category and position; the difference is widely known; ‘which’ is used for things and animals, as explained above, also it is used for non-defining clause, while ‘that’ is used for persons or things, and it is for defining clause. Therefore, the word “yang” here is more identical to ‘that’ in English.

h. *Not Only, But Also*

<i>Dari fakta di atas menunjukkan bahwa orientalisme tidak semata berkembang secara ilmiah murni</i>	From the above facts indicate that Orientalism is <b>not only</b> developing a purely scientific
--	--

<i>tetapi juga dibangun atas dasar kepentingan-kepentingan yang muncul pada suatu masa tertentu.</i>	<b>but also</b> built on the basis of interests that arise at a particular time.
--	--

This pattern is popular in both Indonesian language and English. The cooperative conjunction is basically the same in both language systems; in Indonesian language, it is known as “*tidak hanya...tetapi juga...*” and in English, “not only...but also...” is widely acknowledged by most of learners. Besides the meaning is exactly similar, the words also have no difference in function and category. It can be seen in the sentence above, the Indonesian text form can simply help the students, moreover for students who tended to use word for word method, in directly transferring the words into English correctly.

## 2. Negative Transfer (Interference)

### a. *Two Verbs In One Sentence, In Generally*

<i>..., studi Islam di Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya tidak dapat dilepaskan dari orientalism, sebuah paradigm pemikiran tentang timur atau Islam khususnya, yang menjadi</i>	<i>..., Islamic studies in Germany or Europe in generally cannot be removed from Orientalism, a paradigm of thinking about east or Islam in particular, are becoming</i> mainstream thinking.
---	---

<i>arus utama pemikiran.</i>	
------------------------------	--

Grammatical interferences appear in this sentence; as most of the students were not aware of the distinctions between verbs in English and in Indonesian language. ‘Two verbs in a sentence’ here stands for English grammar’s point of view. The predicate in this sentence is “*tidak bisa dilepaskan*” (“cannot be removed”); the following clauses should not consist of any English verb. Therefore, the appearance of “are becoming” here is students’ mistake and, probably, lack awareness.

Furthermore, the next interference can be seen in the prepositional phrase “*in generally*”. In Eckersley’s book, ‘in’ cannot be followed by adverb of manner, for example generally, practically, clearly, etc. Therefore, this phrase should be ‘in general’.<sup>2</sup>

b. *No Verb In A Sentence, Same With, Similar With,*

<p>..., <i>generasi pertama studi Islam sama dengan orientalisme dengan segala kelebihan dan kekurangannya</i></p>	<p>..., <i>the first generation of Islamic studies same as orientalism with all its pros and cons</i></p>
	<p>..., <i>the first generation Islamic study is same with the</i></p>

<sup>2</sup> C.E. Eckersley, *A Concise English Grammar for...* p. 86.



	Orientalism with all its pros and cons
	..., first generation of Islamic study is <i>similar with</i> the orientalism.

In the first table, the subject is directly followed by adjective *same*; there is no predicate in the sentence. There should be an auxiliary verb *to be* in between them. In addition, *same* indicating *exactly like* commonly comes after 'the'. So, the correct sentence is "..., *the first generation of Islamic studies is the same as orientalism ...*" In the second box, awkward pattern made by the most of students in this translation assignment is *same with*. The adjective *same* is never followed by *with*. The same case also works in the next box; *similar* does not come before *with*. In Betty,<sup>3</sup> preposition combination for the adjective *same* is 'as' and for the word *similar* is 'to'.

- c. *With that also, By it also, By that, With that, no verb in clause, similar with, underline*

<i>Dengan itu pula peneliti menggarisbawahi bahwa konsep</i>	<i>With that also</i> researchers underline <i>that the concept of</i>
--	--

<sup>3</sup> Betty Schramper Azar, *Understanding and Using English Grammar*, p. Appendix A21.

<p><i>studi Islam generasi pertama ini sama dengan orientalisme.</i></p>	<p><i>this first generation of Islamic studies same as the orientalism.</i></p>
	<p><i>By it also</i> the researcher underlines that Islamic concept study in this first generation is the same as orientalism.</p>
	<p><i>By that,</i> the researchers highlighted <i>that the concept of this first generation of Islamic studies together with orientalism</i></p>
<p><i>Dengan itu pula peneliti menggarisbawahi bahwa konsep studi Islam generasi pertama ini sama dengan orientalisme.</i></p>	<p>So the researchers highlight the concept that first generation of Islamic study is <i>similar with</i> the orientalism.</p>
	<p><i>With that</i> the researcher underline that the concept of the first generation of Islamic study is <i>same with</i> orientalism.</p>

*With that also; By it also; By that; With that* are never used as conjunction or connector between sentences. This pattern does not represent “*dengan itu*” in English form; the common words for this are ‘therefore, so, as the result, for that reason’, etc. Exactly the same as the cases above, clauses in the first and third boxes are less verbs. Besides, *similar with* also appears. In the last box, suffix ‘s’ should be added into the verb *underline*; for the subject is single.

d. *As For, Since, Is, At*

<p><i>Adapaun batasannya adalah sejak abad ke 18 masehi sampai runtuhnya orientalisme yakni tahun 1970-an, setelah Edward Said menulis buku ‘Orientalism’.</i></p>	<p><i>As for</i> the limit is <i>since</i> the 18th century M until the fall of orientalism <i>is</i> 1970s, after Edward Said wrote a book Orientalism.</p>
	<p>While the limit <i>since</i> 18th BC until the collapse of Orientalism <i>at</i> 1970's, after Edward Said wrote a book by the title Orientalism.</p>

The form *As for* does not exist in English language system. The next interference is the most frequent in students’ works; *since* followed by *is*.

Eckersley explained that many EFL learners are not aware of the use preposition *since*<sup>4</sup>; this should be used only for perfect tense. The following interference is also caused by preposition; *at* placed before year. It should be *in 1970s*.

- e. *Criticism-On, More Select, Criticism Edward Said, Prefer To ... Than, Critic Edward Said, In Generally*

<p><i>Pasca kritik Edward Said terhadap orientalisme, kajian-kajian tentang Islam di Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya, lebih memillih untuk menggunakan konsep Islamic Studies daripada Orientallisme.</i></p>	<p>After <i>criticism from Edward Said on</i> Orientalism, the studies about Islam in Germany or Europe in general, <i>more select to use</i> the concept of Islamic Studies than Orientalisme.</p>
	<p>After <i>criticism Edward Said on</i> Orientalism, studies on Islam in Germany or Europe in general, <i>prefer to</i> use the concept of Islamic Studies <i>than</i> orientalism.</p>
	<p>After <i>critic Edward Said on</i></p>

<sup>4</sup> Eckersley, *A Concise English Grammar for...* p. 87.

	Orientalism, studies on Islam in Germany or Europe in general, <i>prefer to</i> use the concept of Islamic Studies <i>than</i> orientalism.
	Post <i>criticism Edward Said on</i> Orientalism, studies on Islam in Germany or Europe <i>in generally, the more select to use</i> the concept of Islamic Studies than Orientalisme

The first part that seemingly confuses the students the most is “...*kritik Edward Said terhadap...*”; as showed in the table above, the students tended to translate the preposition combination “*kritik terhadap*” as “*criticism/critic on*”; this is grammatically wrong. In Eckersley, criticism or critic should be followed by *of* or *about*.<sup>5</sup> He also explained that *prefer to* should be combined with *rather than*. Furthermore, even though the lexical meaning of *more* in Indonesian language is *lebih*; grammatically, it only follows some particular verbs and does not come before verbs. It is better to replace the word *more* with *prefer to*.

<sup>5</sup> C.E. Eckersley, *A Concise English Grammar for ...*, p. 90.

f. *It Runs From, It Takes Place Since*

... <i>hal itu berlangsung</i>	... <i>it runs from the</i> 1980s until now.
<i>mulai tahun 1980-an sampai sekarang.</i>	... <i>it takes place since</i> 1980's until now.

The context of the sentence above shows that something began in the past and continues to the present. This means that the students should use perfect progressive tense. So, the sentence above should be “... *it has been running since 1980s.*”

g. *Generation*

<i>Dua lapis atau generasi dalam sejarah pemikiran studi Islam ...</i>	Two layers or <i>generation</i> in the historical thought ...
--	---

The plural form in English is actually a basic pattern for learners. However, for students who have lack of awareness in this will almost always make mistake. “*Generations*” is the correct word for the sentence in the table above.

h. *Relatively Younger, In Relative Younger, Country*

<i>Orientalisme Jerman (German Orientalistik) <b>sesungguhnya relatif lebih muda</b> dibandingkan</i>	Orientalism Germany (German Orientalistic) <i>actually relatively younger</i> than the tradition of ...
---	---

<p><i>tradisi orientalisme di Negara Eropa lainnya seperti Perancis dan Spanyol.</i></p>	<p>Orientalism Germany (German Orientalistic) <i>actually in relative younger</i> than the tradition of ...</p>
	<p>Actually, German orientalism is relatively younger compare with orientalism tradition in European <i>other country</i> like France and Spain.</p>

Sentences in the first and the second students' sentences above do not have verb. There should be a linking verb "is" in between the subject and the complement. Besides, *in relative* commonly shows the meaning of comparison; *in relative young* means younger than before. So that "*in relative younger*" in the sentence above sounds uncommon for English form. Furthermore, the word *country* in sentence inside the next box actually stands for more than one country; which that means it should be plural form. Therefore, the correct sentence is "*Actually, German orientalism is relatively younger compare with orientalism tradition in European other countries like France and Spain.*"





sentence is out of place. Furthermore, in the last translation, as adverb cannot stand alone; the word “*understandably*” should be *understandable*. Finally, the next clause has wrong verb that follows the auxiliary verb; it is always followed by bare infinitive.

j. *Began, Start*

<i>Jerman mulai bersentuhan dengan Islam ...</i>	Germany <b><i>began</i></b> direct contact with Islam ...
	Germany <b><i>start</i></b> connected with Islam ...

There are some certain verbs in English that should be followed by particular preposition or *-ing* verb. One of them is verb *begin*. For that reason, the sentence in the first box should be “*Germany began to be in direct contact with...*” Subsequently, related to the time of the affair in that sentence, it happened a long time ago, therefore past participle form of *start* should be used.

k. *It Is Important Also, Object, Literature, Study Orientalism, Other, Based Oriental, Religion, Is*

<i>Namun demikian perlu juga diketahui bahwa objek studi orientalisme Jerman adalah</i>	But <b><i>it is important also</i></b> known that the <b><i>object</i></b> of <b><i>study</i></b> <b><i>Orientalism German</i></b> is study of
---	--

<p><i>studi Kristiani dan literature-literature agama non Islam lainnya yang berbasis ketimuran.</i></p>	<p>literature Christian and non-Islamic religious <i>literature other</i> eastern based.</p>
	<p>However, it should also be known that the <i>object</i> of study of Orientalism Germany is Christian studies and <i>literature</i> are other non-Islamic religions are <i>based Oriental</i>.</p>
	<p>However we also need to note that the German orientalism study <i>object</i> are christ study and literatures of other (non islamic) <i>religion</i> which <i>is</i> eastern – based.</p>

It can be seen in the nominal sentence above, the bolded part in sentence 1 has word “*also*” that does not go directly after the linking verb; this can be an error caused by the source language. It should be “*it is also important...*” The wrong plural form for “*object*” exists in the first, second and third students’ translation sentences. Back to the first sentence,

the translator misplaced the preposition “*of*” and the adjective “*other*”; this seems influenced by the source language’s word order.

The second translated sentence shows two plural form errors of *object*, as explain before, and *literature*. Besides, the arrangement of “*based*” and “*oriental*” is interchangeable; it has to be *oriental-based*. Finally, the last translation does not have “*object*” as the only wrong pluar form; but also the word “*religion*” there is inappropriate. As *other* should be followed by plural noun, the linking verb then should be *are*.

1. *Became, Developed, Growing, Since*

<p><i>Kajian-kajian ini <b>menjadi</b> bagian dari wacana orientalisme yang <b>berkembang di Jerman bahkan semenjak</b> abad ke 16 masehi.</i></p>	<p><i>These studies <b>became</b> part of the discourse of orientalism that <b>developed in Germany even since</b> the 16th century.</i></p>
	<p>This study <i><b>became</b></i> a part of orientalism discourse that <i><b>growing</b></i> in Germany <i><b>since</b></i> 16 BC.</p>

As explained in the previous point, the preposition “*since*” always follows perfect tense. Therefore, the verbs and tenses used in both translated sentences above are inappropriate.

m. *Become, a Bad Dreams*

<p>..., <i>Orientalisme di Jerman juga menjadi bagian dari suatu impian akademik di satu sisi dan menjadi impian buruk di sisi lain.</i></p>	<p>..., Orientalism in Germany also <b>become</b> part of an academic dream on one side and be a bad dream on the other side</p>
	<p>..., Orientalism in Germany also <b>become</b> a part of academic dreams in a side and becom a <b>bad dreams</b> in the other side.</p>

Inflectional morpheme as the suffix of a verb for third-singular present agreement is actually a basic grammar for English learners; however, they who are lack of awareness in this aspect are likely to make mistake. It can be seen in the sentences above, the students use “*become*” as the verb for “*Orientalism*”; it of course misses the morpheme “*s*”. Additionally, the translated clause in box 2 has article “*a*” before the plural form of dream; it should be a singular form.

- n. *Is, Classify Studies, Who, Focuses, Many Other, Are, Academician, One Classify Of, At Beginning, Was, Scholar*

<p><i>Pada awalnya studi-studi orientalism di Jerman merupakan salah satu pilihan kajian yang bergengsi di mana banyak sarjana Jerman yang menggeluti kajian-kajian ketimuran dan filologi seperti bahasa Sansakerta, Arab dan masih banyak lainnya.</i></p>	<p>At first, studies of Orientalism in Germany <i>is</i> one of the prestigious <i>classify studies</i> in which many German scholars <i>who focuses</i> on oriental studies and philology as language Sanskrit, Arabic and <i>many other.</i></p>
	<p>At first, Orientalism studies in Germany <i>are</i> one of the sorts of prestigious studies where many German <i>academician who</i> cultivate oriental studies ...</p>
	<p>At first, Orientalism studies in Germany <i>are one classify of</i> prestigious studies where many German <i>academician who</i> cultivate oriental studies ...</p>
	<p><i>At begining</i> the orientalism</p>

	studies in Germany <i>was</i> a study of the prestigious increments in which many German <i>scholar</i> cultivate the oriental ...
--	---

It can be assumed that most of the students translated this sentence by disregarding the relations of each word. First of all, dropping the wrong linking verbs when “*orientalism studies*” is the subject, and “*at first*” is the occasion. “*Orientalism studies*” is a plural form and “*At first*” here indicates the past; as the result, “*is, are,*” and “*was*” are inappropriate. The correct clause will be “...*orientalism studies were one of the...*” Secondly, the use of word “*classify*” in sentences 1 and 3 are wrong. When using verbal adjective, the participle form is used;<sup>6</sup> therefore, it should be “... *one of the prestigious classified studies.*”

In relating to verb and sentence predicate, students’ translation in sentences 1, 2, and 3 contain a clause that does not have verb; yet has two adjective clause pronouns. For example, in the first sentence, “... *studies of Orientalism in Germany is one of the prestigious classify studies in which many German scholars who focuses on...*” because the source language includes “*yang*”, the students tended to translate it directly without realizing that the subject after “*in which*” does not have predicate.

---

<sup>6</sup> C.E. Eckersley, *A Concise English Grammar for...*, p. 72.

Morpheme “s” is apparently unusual for the students; especially in this case, the suffix for third singular present’s verb is used for plural subject: “...many German *scholars* who *focuses* on...” In contrast, the morpheme does not exist for the plural nouns; in sentence 2, 3, and 4 (“*academician*” and “*scholar*”). Finally, commonly “*beginning*” refers to things or people when only one exists at any one time; therefore, determiner “*the*” is needed before it.

o. *Do Not, Make, Does Not, Must Fully Engage*

<p><i>Namun, suasana politik kadang tidak mendukungnya, waktu di mana Jerman harus terlibat penuh dalam perang dunia pertama maupun kedua menjadikan studi orientalisme kurang mendapat dukungan dari pemerintah.</i></p>	<p>But, the political atmosphere sometimes <b>do not</b> support it, the time in which Germany must be fully engaged in the first and second world wars <b>make</b> study of Orientalism lack of support from the government.</p>
	<p>However, sometimes the political conditions <b>do not</b> support it, in the time when Germany must be fully involved in the first or second</p>

	<p>world wars made the Orientalism study lack of support from the government.</p>
	<p>However, the political atmosphere sometimes <i>does not</i> support it, the time in which Germany <i>must fully engage</i> in the first and second world wars <i>to make</i> the study of Orientalism lack of support from the government.</p>

One of the most obvious differences between Indonesian language and English is tenses pattern. In the sentences above, for the specific time of the issue was in the first and the second world wars; so those should be the past forms. In the third translated sentence, passive voice should be used; the English form is also very much different from Indonesian's. This reason is inherent in almost students' writing.

*p. Scientific, Shows, Basic Interests, Appear*

<p><i>Dari fakta di atas menunjukkan bahwa orientalisme tidak semata</i></p>	<p>From the above facts indicate that Orientalism is not only</p>
--	---



<i>berkembang secara ilmiah murni</i> <i>tetapi juga ...</i>	developing a purely <i>scientific</i> but also ...
	From the facts above <i>shows</i> that orientalism is not merely developing a purely <i>scientific</i> but also ...

First of all, error productions in both translated sentences above caused by the word “*scientific*”. For it is an adjective, it cannot independently follow the adverb; besides, it modifies noun or pronoun. Thus, the phrase should be “*scientifically developed*”. In addition, in the second translation, wrong subject-verb agreement occur containing suffix “s” in a present verb for plural noun.

## B. Discussion

The presented data and the explanation above draw the categorization of grammatical transfer made by the students. Of course, the correct patterns influenced by Indonesian language structure result positive transfer and the error productions bring the negative transfer. These following tables, containing the same sentences as mentioned in the research findings, come after the explanation related to the types of grammatical transfer in the theoretical framework. Categorizing the types is based on English grammar’s point of view. Particularly,

the researcher discusses about the comparison between English and Indonesian language grammar that causes the transfers. Additionally, the comparison can be fundamental information in figuring out the structural factors.

Initially, here are the types of grammatical transfer in both positive transfer (facilitation) and negative transfer (interference):

### 1. English Grammar Facilitated by Indonesian Grammar

#### a. Preposition: 'In'

As the main objects of this study are translated texts, of course this strongly relates to meaning. Certainly, this study found some words that seemingly cause semantic transfers but also contribute in the structures of the sentences. Beginning with the preposition in the sentence below; Indonesian language has preposition “*pada*” as the variant of “*di*”<sup>7</sup> which is dropped before noun or adjective. Related to the grammatical system factor, both languages are roughly equal in this category. For students who still tend to use word for word method or barely master the Basic English grammar, this can be a huge help that is typically unnoticeable. The table below shows the example of it:

..., <i>studi Islam di Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya tidak</i>	..., Islamic studies in Germany or Europe <b>in general</b> cannot be
---	---

<sup>7</sup> Abdul Chaer, *Tata Bahasa Praktis Bahasa Indonesia*, revision edition (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2011), p. 124

<i>dapat dilepaskan dari</i>	separated from Orientalism, ...
<i>orientalism, ...</i>	

b. *Modal: 'Can'*

Basically, particular category such as 'modal' does not exist in Indonesian language structure; it is included into *kata keterangan* (adverb). However, as explained in chapter 2, Swan and Smith explored that the meaning of 'can' and 'must', especially, mostly facilitate Indonesian learners.<sup>8</sup> Indeed, the negative forms in both languages are different as shown in the first sentence. Nevertheless, the negative form of modal is a basic level of English grammar; therefore this is not a major problem for the students. Besides, the function and the position of the words in a sentence are exactly the same; it is shown in these following sentences:

... <i>Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya tidak dapat dilepaskan dari orientalism, ...</i>	... Germany or Europe in general <b>cannot</b> be separated from Orientalism, ...
<i>Hal itu bisa dimaklumi ...</i>	It <b>can</b> be understandably ...

c. *To be: 'Is'*

---

<sup>8</sup> Smith and Swan, *Learner English...* p. 288

Regarding this, Swan and Smith noted that most learners assume that ‘to be’ has various Indonesian meaning, those are ‘*berada, adalah, yakni* and *ialah*’.<sup>9</sup> When those occur in Indonesian sentences, regularly Indonesian learners are facilitated in translating the words and the sentences. Basically, the grammatical system of Indonesian language and English related to this is not identically the same. In Chaer, Indonesian words mentioned above are identified as connectors.<sup>10</sup> Even so, the words and ‘to be’ take the similar responsibility in nominal sentence; to be the predicate of the sentence and to explain, describe and state about the subject. Also, separated from the participle form and the like, ‘to be’ is repeatedly used in representing the word “*merupakan*” as can be seen in the sentence in this table:

<i>Dengan demikian, Islamic Studies merupakan generasi kedua tradisi ...</i>	Accordingly, Islamic Studies is a second-generation tradition ...
--	---

d. *Conjunction: ‘Or, That, Not Only...but Also, After’*

In literature review of this research, conjunction is not mentioned as one of the grammatical transfer’s types. However, based on the analyzed

<sup>9</sup> Smith and Swan, *Learner English...* p. 287.

<sup>10</sup> Chaer, *Tata Bahasa Praktis Bahasa Indonesia...* pp. 151–152.

data, English connectors as the result of source language's involvement appeared. It is not an odd type of category in English grammatical system; the bolded Indonesian words below are embraced as '*kata penghubung*' or known as conjunction in English. The function of the words in both languages is the same; to connect words, phrases, clauses and sentences. Those do not have meaning when standing independently. This type of facilitation is figured out as mentioned in the research findings and sorted in this following table:

<p>..., <i>kajian-kajian tentang Islam di Jerman <b>atau</b> Eropa pada umumnya, lebih memillih untuk ...</i></p>	<p>..., studies on Islam in Germany <b>or</b> Europe in general prefer to ...</p>
<p><i>Namun demikian perlu juga diketahui <b>bahwa</b> objek studi orientalisme Jerman ...</i></p>	<p>But it is important also known <b>that</b> the object of study Orientalism German ...</p>
<p><i>Dari fakta di atas menunjukkan bahwa orientalisme <b>tidak semata</b> berkembang secara ilmiah murni <b>tetapi juga</b> dibangun atas dasar kepentingan-kepentingan yang</i></p>	<p>From the above facts indicate that Orientalism is <b>not only</b> developing a purely scientific <b>but also</b> built on the basis of interests that arise at a particular</p>

<i>muncul pada suatu masa tertentu.</i>	time.
..., <i>setelah</i> Edward Said menulis buku <i>Orientalism</i> .	..., <b>after</b> Edward Said wrote a book <i>Orientalism</i> .

e. *Relative Pronouns: 'That'*

English has more kinds of pronoun than Indonesian language. In particular, relative pronouns dealing with adjective clause do not exist in Indonesian language system. Swan and Smith stated that in representing *who*, *whose*, *whom*, *which*, and *that* it only has one word which is actually included into one of its connectors, not a pronoun; the word is '*yang*'.<sup>11</sup> In this viewpoint, the grammatical system of both languages is different. On the other hand, '*yang*' as connector facilitates the translators, especially those who used word for word method, to transfer the words grammatically correct. Except the categorization aspect, this following sentence shows that the character of the relative word in both languages is almost the same:

<i>Kajian-kajian ini menjadi bagian dari wacana orientalisme yang berkembang di Jerman ...</i>	These studies became part of the discourse of orientalism <b>that</b> developed in Germany ...
--	--

<sup>11</sup> Smith and Swan, *Learner English*... p. 284.

Overall, the types of facilitation mentioned above are categorized into particular English word class; moreover, those also can be included into another type of positive transfer; word order. Most students using word for word method without considering grammatical system and the pattern directly transferring the words are facilitated by the order of the words in the source language. In general, all the facilitation phenomena produced by the students and analyzed in this study are also incorporated into word order type.

## 2. English Grammar Interfered by Indonesian Grammar

### a. *Word Order: "the Era of The Glory of Islam, study Orientalism German"*

Based on the discussion related to the positive transfer in the previous point, Indonesian language's word order significantly covers an important role in facilitating the students to translate phrases, clauses and sentences. However, it is also can be a black hole for those who neglect or have low level in English grammar. They just tended to construct the sentences purely based on the source language word arrangement. Although there are some particular grammatical systems or patterns that are the same, different languages of course have differences in other aspects.

Taken from students' translation, these following sentences are apparently not a big deal in error production; those are still understandable. The first sentence in this table is actually not wrong; it is grammatically correct. The students used determiner "the" and preposition

“of” correctly, the correlation among the words and the word class are also appropriate; however, the last prepositional phrase sounds awkward. The phrase is strongly involved by the source language’s phrase. In addition, the second sentence contains some phrases that positioning the head and the modifier interchangeably. Those are completely shown in this following table:

<p>... <i>Jerman tidak bersentuhan langsung dengan Islam di era kejayaan Islam.</i></p>	<p>... German not in direct contact with the German Islam in <i>the era of the glory of Islam.</i></p>
<p><i>Namun demikian perlu juga diketahui bahwa objek studi orientalisme Jerman adalah studi Kristiani dan literature-literature agama non Islam lainnya yang berbasis ketimuran.</i></p>	<p>But <i>it is important also</i> known that the object of <i>study Orientalism German</i> is study of literature Christian and non-Islamic religious literature <i>other</i> eastern based.</p>

- b. Number: “*Generation, Country, Object, Literature, Religion, Dreams Other, Academician, Scholar*”

Indonesian language has particular words to indicate that something has plural meaning. Also, it generally mentions the word repeatedly such as *kucing-kucing, buku buku* and so on. This can be a general reason to construct English plural word wrongly. Suffix ‘s’ does not exist in



Indonesian language for plural word. It can be seen in the first sentence of the table below.

Morpheme 's' as the sign of plural form is actually one of basic structure. Lack of awareness in inserting it can be a strong reason behind the error construction; however the 'lack' itself might have other reasons related to words surrounding it. Taking the second sentence as an instance, it shows that "France" and "Spain" are aimed to be the examples of the word "country"; besides, there are amount of countries in Europe. Therefore, the mentioned considerations were seemingly neglected by the students; so they translated the word grammatically wrong.

Related to words enclosing the plural nouns; some particular words that modifies noun are apparently unconscious for the students. Some sentences below prove that using "many" does not always help students to produce the plural noun following it. This type has the most interfered sentences; it establishes that the students did not regularly add suffix 's'. In contrast, there is a sentence produced by one of the students that has a plural noun dropped after article "a". It shows that the students seemed habitually used the determiner without considering the function and the responsibility of it.

<i>Dua lapis atau generasi dalam sejarah pemikiran ...</i>	Two layers or <b>generation</b> in the historical thought ...
--	---



<p>... di mana <b>banyak sarjana Jerman</b> yang menggeluti kajian-kajian ketimuran dan filologi seperti bahasa Sansakerta, Arab dan masih <b>banyak lainnya</b>.</p>	<p>... in which many German scholars who focuses on oriental studies and philology as language Sanskrit, Arabic and <b>many other</b>.</p>
	<p>... where <b>many</b> German <b>academician</b> who cultivate oriental studies ...</p>
	<p>... where <b>many</b> German <b>academician</b> who cultivate oriental studies ...</p>
	<p>... in which <b>many</b> German <b>scholar</b> cultivate the oriental studies ...</p>

c. *Possessive Pronouns: "Criticism Edward Said, Critic Edward Said"*

In Swan and Smith's explanation, 'gender and possessive pronouns' are united as one type of grammatical transfer. However, language structure related to gender between English and Indonesian language is dissimilar; Indonesian language system does not have exacting rules for

gender aspect. As the result, positive transfer in sort of gender does not possibly exist. Besides, based on the analyzed data, interference focusing on gender is also not found. Therefore, this negative transfer is only categorized into ‘possessive pronoun’ point.

Basically, inflectional morpheme rule for this aspect has been widely known, especially for students in this level. However, the sentence in this following table successfully deceived the students resulting incorrect translated construction. The main problem is not in the English possessive word, but it is more likely caused by the word “*kritik*”. Some students rarely translate it; even some of them transferred it into the adjective form. The translated noun form is also missing the possessive sign and the phrase is constructed inappropriately. The table below contains some of the students’ error translation sentence for this case:

<p><i>Pasca kritik Edward Said terhadap orientalisme, kajian-kajian tentang Islam di Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya, ...</i></p>	<p>After <i>criticism Edward Said</i> on Orientalism, studies on Islam in Germany or Europe in general, ...</p>
	<p>After <i>critic Edward Said</i> on Orientalism, studies on Islam in Germany or Europe in general, ...</p>

d. *Relative Pronouns: “Who”*

Betty described clause as “a structure that has a subject and a verb.”<sup>12</sup> The enlightenment is the fundamental guidance for English learners in construct a clause; at least, it consists of a subject and a verb. As explained before, the only Indonesian language relative word is ‘*yang*’, yet, this text shows another form of it. “*dimana*” in the sentence below does not refer to a meaning of place; it modifies the previous noun phrase. Therefore, it is the other variant of ‘*yang*’ in constructing adjective clause that commonly used in Indonesian text or spoken sentence.

As forming an independent clause, the following subject of “*dimana*” should also have a verb. Looking at the sentence in the table below, the students seemingly misunderstood. By adding another relative pronoun after the subject because of the word ‘*yang*’ in the source text, the students translated the clause grammatically mistaken. This following sentence is one example of three different sentences produced by five students:

... <i>salah satu pilahan kajian yang bergengsi dimana banyak sarjana Jerman yang menggeluti</i>	... one of the prestigious classify studies <b>in which</b> many German scholars <b>who focuses</b>
--	---

<sup>12</sup> Betty Schramper Azar, *Fundamentals of English grammar* (White Plains, NY: Longman, 2003), p. 343.

<i>kajian-kajian ketimuran dan ...</i>	on oriental studies and ...
--	-----------------------------

e. *Articles/determiners: “At Beginning”*

Using determiners is actually not easy for some students; it occasionally confuses them. Moreover for those who have not got into the habit of reading academic text nor write English text, when to use them and how, also, which determiners should be used for particular words and situations are uncertainty. This type of grammatical interference in this case is actually quite complex. One student produced ‘beginning’ to explain time without dropping ‘the’ before it. Some students tended to use ‘first’ for it is a simpler form. The source language does not have determiner, so that the student produced the adverbial phrase inappropriately.

<i>Pada awalnya studi-studi orientalism di Jerman merupakan salah satu pilahan kajian ...</i>	<i>At begining</i> the orientalism studies in Geirmany was a study of the prestigious increments ...
---	--

f. *Verbs: “Are Becoming, Underline, Become, Shows”*

Amount of mistakes in producing verb has been apparently general for Indonesian learners. It is broadly known that Indonesian verbs do not change when there is different subject or transformation in time signal. In

addition, other form of inappropriate construction caused by verbs also occurs. Similar to adjective clause in English, Indonesian language also needs relative words to comprise more than one verb in a sentence. However, English has another form of creating adjective clause; by replacing the relative pronoun with the present participle form of the verb. This method seemingly was not mastered by some students; the result can be seen in the first sentence below. Nine students produced two clauses in one sentence without relative word because of the linking verb “are” is dropped before the present participle form.

In the second sentence, wrong subject-verb agreement occurs because two students did not attentively consider the difference of the agreement in both languages. The same case also appears in the third and the fourth sentences. In addition, other cases regarding to the inappropriate verb are actually more than the table below. However, because those are also in connection to ‘*time, tense, and aspect*’ and ‘*to be*’; those are enlightened in the next points. The sentences below shows grammatical interference that purely categorized based on the produced verb:

<p>..., <i>studi Islam di Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya <b>tidak dapat dilepaskan</b> dari orientalism, sebuah paradigm pemikiran</i></p>	<p>..., Islamic studies in Germany or Europe in general <b>can not be separated</b> from Orientalism, a paradigm of thinking about east</p>
--	---

<i>tentang timur atau Islam khususnya, yang menjadi arus utama pemikiran.</i>	or Islam in particular, <b>are becoming</b> mainstream thinking.
<i>Dengan itu pula peneliti menggarisbawahi bahwa ...</i>	With that the <b>researcher underline</b> that ...
<i>..., Orientalisme di Jerman juga menjadi bagian dari suatu impian akademik ...</i>	..., Orientalism in Germany also <b>become</b> part of an academic dream ...
<i>Dari fakta di atas menunjukkan bahwa orientalisme tidak semata berkembang secara ilmiah murni ...</i>	From the facts above <b>shows</b> that orientalism is not merely developing a purely scientific ...

g. *Time, tense, and aspect*

1) *Past time: "Do not, Start, Are,*

Indonesian language uses the fasten form of verb for dissimilar subject and various periods of time. This language principal rule is a very basic difference of Indonesian language and English and widely known, especially by the students. However, errors caused in this type which means caused by the difference still arise. Moreover, the wrong



verbs for different tenses are produced in big numbers by amount of students.

Kinds of verb; auxiliary, be and bare infinitive are incorrectly used in this following sentences. Whereas the comprehensible time signal for past tense and the adverbial clause in the sentences are clearly stated. As the affair of the sentence happened in the past, the verbs have to be in form of past participle. For the students probably did not give full attention to this matter, these following errors as the result of source language's influence frequently arise.

<p><i>Hal itu bisa dimaklumi karena memang Jerman tidak bersentuhan langsung ...</i></p>	<p>It may be because Germany <b>do not</b> know directly ...</p>
<p><i>Jerman mulai bersentuhan dengan Islam ketika berada di kekuasaan Turki Ustmani pada abad ke 17-18 M.</i></p>	<p>Germany <b>start</b> connected with Islam under the authority of Turki Utsmani in 17 – 18 BC.</p>
<p><i>Pada awalnya studi-studi orientalism di Jerman merupakan salah satu pilahan kajian ...</i></p>	<p>At first, Orientalism studies in Germany <b>are</b> one of the sorts of prestigious studies ...</p> <p>At first, Orientalism studies in</p>

	Germany <i>are</i> one classify of prestigious studies ...
<i>Namun, suasana politik kadang <b>tidak</b> mendukungnya, waktu di mana Jerman harus terlibat penuh dalam perang dunia pertama maupun kedua <b>menjadikan</b> studi orientalisme kurang mendapat dukungan dari pemerintah.</i>	But, the political atmosphere sometimes <i>do not</i> support it, the time in which Germany must be fully engaged in the first and second world wars <i>make</i> study of Orientalism lack of support from the government.
	However, the political atmosphere sometimes <i>does not</i> support it, the time in which Germany must fully engage in the first and second world wars <i>to make</i> the study of Orientalism lack of support from the government.

2) *Perfect: “Runs, Takes, Became, Developed, Growing”*

Perfect tense in English Grammar is well known as the complex aspect. The pattern is a bit longer and more complicated than the others; besides, some learners did not perfectly understand when to use perfect tense and past tense; those are often produced interchangeably. In addition, some of them also could not distinguish the time signals, especially those that are indicated by preposition; ‘since’ and ‘for’. This case frequently occurs in almost a half of the subjects’ work as shown in this following table:

<p>... <i>Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya dan hal itu berlangsung mulai tahun 1980-an sampai sekarang.</i></p>	<p>... Germany or Europe in general and <i>it runs from the 1980s until now.</i></p>
	<p>... Germany or Europe in general and <i>it takes place since 1980’s until now.</i></p>
<p><i>Kajian-kajian ini menjadi bagian dari wacana orientalisme yang berkembang di Jerman bahkan semenjak abad ke 16 masehi.</i></p>	<p><i>These studies became part of the discourse of orientalism that developed in Germany even since the 16th century.</i></p>
	<p>This study <i>became</i> a part of</p>

	orientalism discourse that <i>growing</i> in Germany <i>since</i> 16
--	---

*h. To be: "Is, Are, Was"*

'To be' is responsible for the main part in an English clause and sentence. It is stated in chapter 2 that the absence of 'to be' in Indonesian language pattern is replaced with particular conjunctions ("*adalah, yaitu, merupakan,* and so on). Therefore, when there is no word '*adalah*' and the like written in the source text, the students habitually translate the clause or the sentence without inserting the linking verb. In most cases, they forget that it is crucially important in constructing English clause and sentence. The interferences are produced by the students in the sentence 1, 2, 3, and 4.

In addition, dealing with the subject-verb agreement, sentences below show the wrong relation between the subject and the 'to be'. Beyond the tenses pattern, the linking verbs are inappropriate because of those are used for single subject when the subject of the sentence is plural; as in sentence 5 and 7, and vice versa. This type grammatical interference is strongly related to the time of the occasion happens, 'To be' that supposes to be used for present tense comes in sentence indicating the past time; it is shown in sentence 6.



	Germany <b>are</b> one of the sorts of prestigious studies ...
	At begining the orientalism studies in Germany <b>was</b> a study of the prestigious increments ...

i. *Prepositions: "Same With, Similar With, With That Also, By It Also, By That, As for, Since, At, On, From.*

Dominating the students' mistakes aspect, this type of grammatical interference actually also takes a significant role in facilitating the students to translate the Indonesian text. As mentioned in the 'positive transfer' point above, some grammatical systems of Indonesian language and English are similar; however, for students who transferred each word lexically, awkwardness will appear especially in target language's limited words. In English grammatical rules, even prepositions have their own paired words for particular meaning and function. Therefore, some prepositions produced by students in these following sentences are mistaken because of the special rules related to preposition combinations, also related to tenses used in the sentence. In addition, preposition combinations that are actually never used and even not common errors exist in here.

Specifically, sentences in first, second, sixth, seventh, tenth, and eleventh rows of this table are included into wrong combinations of preposition and adjective, also preposition and noun. Additionally, uncommon prepositional phrase also appears in sentence 3, 4, 5, 8, and 14. Last but not the least, inappropriate prepositions showing time signal for perfect tense arise in sentence 9, 12, 13, 15 and 16 in the table below:

<p>..., <i>generasi pertama studi Islam sama dengan orientalisme dengan segala kelebihan dan kekurangannya</i></p>	<p>..., the first generation Islamic study is <i>same with</i> the Orientalism with all its pros and cons</p>
<p><i>Dengan itu pula peneliti menggarisbawahi bahwa ...</i></p>	<p>..., first generation of Islamic study is <i>similar with</i> the orientalism.</p> <p><i>With that also</i> researchers underline that ...</p> <p><i>By it also</i> the researcher underlines that ...</p> <p><i>By that,</i> the researchers highlighted that ...</p>
<p>... <i>studi Islam generasi pertama</i></p>	<p>... Islamic study is <i>similar with</i></p>





<p>umumnya dan <b>hal itu</b> <b>berlangsung mulai</b> tahun 1980- an sampai sekarang.</p>	<p>1980s until now. ... in Germany or Europe in general and <b>it takes place since</b> 1980's until now.</p>
<p>... Jerman tidak bersentuhan langsung dengan Islam di era kejayaan Islam.</p>	<p>... Germany do not know directly <b>with</b> Islam in the glory's era of Islam</p>
<p>Kajian-kajian ini <b>menjadi</b> bagian dari wacana orientalisme yang <b>berkembang di Jerman bahkan</b> <b>semenjak</b> abad ke 16 masehi.</p>	<p>These studies <b>became</b> part of the discourse of orientalism that <b>developed in Germany even</b> <b>since</b> the 16th century. This study <b>became</b> a part of orientalism discourse that <b>growing</b> in Germany <b>since</b> 16 BC.</p>

- j. *Adjectives and Adverbs: "In Generally, Book Orientalism, More Select, In Relative, Understandably, Based Oriental, Classify Studies, Classify of, Scientific"*

Indonesian language has adjectives and adverbs; the responsibility of the words in a sentence is the same. Both languages use adjective to

modify noun and adverb to modify verb, adjective and adverb. However, the position of adjective in Indonesian language is different from English. It mostly results interchangeable arrangement in constructed phrase. Furthermore, adverb that explains the way someone to do something in Indonesian language sometimes consists of two words; '*dengan*' and '*secara*' are dropped before the main word. In addition, some students are still confused by the use of adverb and adjective in English sentence. The various cases can be seen in this table:

... <i>Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya tidak dapat dilepaskan dari orientalism, ...</i>	... Germany or Europe <i>in generally</i> cannot be removed from Orientalism, ...
..., <i>setelah Edward Said menulis buku 'Orientalism'.</i>	..., after Edward Said wrote a <i>book Orientalism.</i>
... <i>di Jerman atau Eropa pada umumnya, lebih memilih untuk menggunakan ...</i>	... in Germany or Europe in general, <i>more select</i> to use ...
	... in Germany or Europe <i>in generally</i> , the more select to use ...
<i>Orientalisme Jerman (German Orientalistik) sesungguhnya</i>	Orientalism Germany (German Orientalistic) actually <i>in</i>

<i>relatif lebih muda</i> dibandingkan tradisi orientalisme ...	<i>relative younger</i> than the tradition of Orientalism ...
Hal itu <i>bisa dimaklumi</i> karena memang Jerman ...	It can be <i>understandably</i> because Germany ...
... <i>literature-literature</i> agama non Islam lainnya yang <i>berbasis ketimuran</i> .	... literature are other non-Islamic religions are <i>based Oriental</i> .
... merupakan salah satu <i>pilihan kajian</i> yang bergengsi di mana banyak sarjana Jerman ...	... is one of the prestigious <i>classify studies</i> in which many German scholars ...
	At first, Orientalism studies in Germany <i>are one classify of</i> prestigious studies where many German academician ...
... <i>bahwa orientalisme tidak semata berkembang secara ilmiah</i> murni tetapi juga ...	... that Orientalism is not only developing a purely <i>scientific</i> but also ...

### 3. Factors in Grammatical Transfer

This has been explained in chapter 2 that structural factors are considered based on the point of view of both source language grammar and target language grammar. Rooted in Weinreich theory above, the structural factors in grammatical transfer in students' English translation are:

#### a. Positive Transfers:

- The same relation pattern

Relation pattern deals with 'Word order, Topicalisation Structure, To be, Question forms and question tag, and Complex sentences'. Regarding to these kinds, based on the phenomena arising in findings, types of the positive transfer are *Word Order* and *To be*. Indonesian language has numerous of word arrangements that are compatible with English language. Specifically, the position of preposition 'in' coming before noun, modal and 'to be' following the subject, some common conjunctions connecting nouns and phrases, and relative word being dropped in between clauses conspicuously or inconspicuously help the students to transfer the pattern. In addition, to be 'is' is the most frequently used to stand for describing subject.

- The same grammatical system

The previous explanation clearly states regarding the same grammatical system, as the types that are produced by the students in

this research and resulted by this factor are Relative Pronoun, Modal auxiliary verb; Preposition. Although Swan and Smith did not mention conjunction in it; considering that conjunction is one of minor part of speech, it is accord with preposition.

b. Negative Transfers:

- Congruent systems, much common vocabulary, relatively unbound morphemes, greater phonemic bulk.

Affixation systems in Indonesian language and English language are totally different. Therefore the types of the interference discussed above are typically caused by morpheme. In detail explanation point, the types caused by the difference are: Numbers, Possessive Pronouns, Verbs, Time, Tense and Aspects and Adjectives and Adverbs

- Different relation pattern.

Word order and 'To be' are types of the negative transfer produced by the students. Two awkward orders of words in two different sentences are caused by the position of the words in the source language text. In addition, out of the subject and the time of the event, the absence of 'to be' in the source language text leads the students to omit linking verb in a sentence.

- Very different grammatical systems.

Kinds of relative word in Indonesian language are not as many as English's resulting interference type in form of Relative Pronoun. Furthermore, articles/determiners do not exist in Indonesian language system. Additionally, different and similar prepositions in both languages sometimes can lead learners to produce Preposition inappropriately.

