

CHAPTER IV

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

This research aims to investigate types of feedback and students' attitude toward feedback. This chapter presents the finding of from the data collected from the document observation and questionnaire. This chapter also provides the discussion of the finding.

A. The types of feedback trough paragraph writing class

Based on preliminary research, students felt indolent about peer feedback, they prefer that teacher's feedback much important. But lecture use the mode of peer feedback; also, the theory stated that peer feedback is useful for improving leaner's work ¹ , students expect that peer feedback is not important for them but lecture use peer feedback for teaching. To know the problems, it much need to find type of feedback and students' attitude toward feedback by doing research. For this propose, this research has been done to collect the data about the type of feedback in the learning process of writing class paragraph second semester of English Education Departement UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya. There are four classes but only a class that used peer feedback as the strategy of teaching. There were two research questions in this study, first, what types of feedback do students get from their peers, and the second, what do the students attitude toward they get feedback from their peers.

As stated in Chapter II , feedback classification of this study was adapted from Hyland and Hyland's classification scheme. There are three types of feedback: praise , criticism, and suggestion,² and added up from the other theory corrective feedback is also as a type of feedback³.

¹ Hyland.K and Hyland F. *Feedback on second language students' writing*. (Cambridge University press 2006)

² Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland, "*feedback in second language writing*", (London, University of London, 2006), P.117

³ Roy Lyster and Leila Ranta, "*Corrective feedback and learner uptake*". (Cambridge Univercity1997),39

The first data collecting for types of feedback was done in the 6th May 2014. Students' writing was under topic of being economical. Observation of and reading on the students' written feedback on the first data collection result in the following types of feedback. There are nine feedbacks that fall into the category of 'praise, Table 4.1. presents the nine praises.

Table 4.1

The result of praise feedback from the document of students' work

Praise
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It's a good paragraph 2. This paragraph is coherence between topic and supporting sentence 3. I think the paragraph is well 4. This is good enough 5. This supporting sentence is good enough because it contains the statistic 6. I think this paragraph can be understood easily 7. I think this paragraph is good, because the sentence suitable with the title and also theme. 8. Paragrappya sudah bagus namun kurang ditambahi tips tipsnya seputar menabung.namun yang lainnya sudah bagus dari punctuation, and isinya 9. The paragraph already good and clearly , but you have more carefully about punctuation

The second category of feedback collected from the first data collection is criticism; it is almost the same with the negative feedback or negative comment.

Table 4.2

Presents the criticism feedback from the first data collection

Criticism
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1.Your title is more general 2.This paragraph is not correspond with theme, the theme is being economic. 3.These sentences is not unity with the previous explanation 4.This supporting sentence cannot support the topic sentence 5.This sentence is not suitable with the topic 6.I think the supporting sentence don't support the topic sentence 7.Ketika membaca isi dari paragraph ini menurut saya isinya terlalu bertele-tele sehingga orang yang membaca tidak menemukan dari inti topic sentencenya. 8.Susunan kalimatnya membingungkan 9.This paragraph most discuss about saving money and little discuss about being economical the water 10. It is good paragraph but it is not clear two or one paragraph 11. Too many using preposition and modal such as can and to 12. There are so many unimportant word 13. It is so difficult to understand the purpose of the text 14. I think this paragraph can not be understood because the words that used is difficult and there is no coherence the one sentence to the other sentence.

Students also give suggestion to their friends. Their suggestion are presented in

Table 4.3

The result of suggestion feedback from the document of students' work

Suggestion
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It would be better if you pay more attention to the use of some words, conjunction, and punctuation. 2. For make paragraph you must give space in the first line 3. For easily to correct, you can give a space in each sentence. 4. Just repair the little grammatical error 5. You should answer why it can be the best way 6. Please give a space under the line 7. Most of the sentence tell about life in Jakarta, so, it's better talking about lifestyle in Jakarta. 8. Mungkin akan lebih baik jika kalimat-kalimat ini dihilangkan atau diperbaiki sehingga tidak bertele tele dan langsung membahas topic sentence

The last category of feedback is corrective feedback. This feedback only focuses on grammatical errors. It shows below.

Table 4.4

The result of corrective feedback from the document of students' work

Corrective
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Jika kata sebelumnya menggunakan "S" maka sebaiknya menggunakan S juga d kata berikutnya I have two books and pen, pen should be pens 2. "this is can make family" you can delete is because modal do not need to be

3. “peoples” you do not need to put “S”
4. “By doing those tips”, you can use the not those

Based on the percentages above, we can know that criticism is most feedback that uses for comment, it can collect 40% criticism from students work in doing peers, and then followed by praise with 26% , suggestion is number three with 23%, it only can find 5 corrective feedback and can percentage with 11% . Because the students do peers at the first time and also do the first assignment, so some of the students did mistake , it can be said that because the students did mistake, as a result when they do peers, their friends gave criticism to their friends’ work.

The second investigation of peer feedback showed somewhat different result of peer feedback, compared to the first data collection with both criticism and suggestion as two most given types of feedback. although criticism is still the dominant type of feedback, its frequency lower than the first. It is because the number of suggestion increases reaching equal frequency to criticism. The result of the second data collection is presented in the following Table.

Table 4.5

The result of praise feedback from second document of students’ work

Praise
1. praise : good paragraph
2. great job
3. It’s good
4. I think this paragraph is well
5. Great job for you Letty and remember don’t be lazy

6. I think this is good paragraph and I think this is

The second category of feedback collected from the second data collection is criticism; it is almost the same with the negative comment or feedback.

Table 4.6

The result of criticism feedback from second document of students' work

Criticism
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Too specific paragraph2. Sentence is not complete3. There is not concluding related to topic sentence4. I can not find the topic sentence because of comma5. I think you just explain your experience and the tragedy of ice cream less explanation6. I think too many explanation of walls day but the explanation of terrible tragedy is little7. Little unmatched sentence8. What make the serious damage in the park? is it directly damage there? Or you mean because of the event? you didn't explain more what kinds of event that held there.9. Your sentence is irregular but I know what you mean10. Akhir dari paragraph kurang pas karena kurang dijelaskan kembali hubungan bungkul dengan event walls

Students in doing peers also collected suggestion feedback, there are 10 suggestion feedback that can collect in the second activity of giving feedback. it is showed in Table

Table 4.7

The result of suggestion feedback from second document of students' work

Suggestion
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Your paragraph too general, you can choose to explain your first or second experience more detail 2. It's better that the explanation of walls day only in Surabaya 3. You should make your title with "A tragedy after walls ice cream" 4. Tidak dikasih ini juga gpp biar gak bingung "because of step on by visitors" 5. You have not to say this "there was a lot of free ice cream" 6. You must careful with comma and capital 7. You don't need put comma before and for parallel sentence 8. Correct your punctuation again and more careful about it! 9. You have to organize your words one by one until clearly 10. Seharusnya tidak usah memakai yang saya garis bawah karena kurang sesuai dengan topic yang dibahas yaitu bungkul.

The last category of feedback is corrective feedback. It could be found 5 corrective feedback that can collect in the second activity of giving feedback. it is showed in Table below

Table 4.8.

The result of corrective feedback from second document of students' work

Corrective
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Use which2. Use was3. Use want not wants because the subject is people4. Use because of5. Use had not have

Then it could be concluded that the result in two analysis of students' document based on the data got, the percentage is listed below:

Table 4.9

Percentage all result of feedback

Percentage of answer			
Praise	Criticism	Suggestion	Corrective
22%	36%	27%	15%

Based on the percentage above, it can be seen that criticism is the dominant feedback used by students in doing peers with 36%, Suggestion can collect in 27% and praise state in 22%, and the last corrective feedback can be collected only 15%, because corrective feedback could find only 10 corrective feedback from the data collection . So, this research had been dominant feedback got from data analysis.

It is also shown that some students thought creatively, they gave some comments, at that time they discussed the topic “the tragedy in Bungkul park in ice cream walls event”. Different with the first topic, in the second topic there were some papers are clearly they only gave the comment it is good work, it is great job as it can be shown in the table of feedback result. And between criticism and suggestion, the students had the same they made 10 both of them, as it is shown in the table the students’ critical thinking were working here. So, it could collect 10 suggestion and criticism.

It can be concluded that when the students do peers, they give feedback as what they know or the lesson getting from the lecture, criticism feedback is dominate in this result, if the students get much mistake so it would be got much criticism if the students work as the lecture instruction it would be got many praise feedbacks. This result based on the second and the first data. The first data show there are a lot of criticism because they do the assignment in the first time, and the second data it can be shown criticism feedback less than before, and the students’ work were getting better. Different from the research before, Hyland and Hyland’s research (2001)⁴, in which 44% of comment in their research were related to praise, 31% were related to criticism and only 25% were related to suggestion. The differentiate between the present study and Hyland and Hyland is they were analysis teacher comment not the student comment, so here it can conclude that different from teacher, students tend to give negative comment less praise. It is also because student learn to give nature of feedback⁵. They give feedback what they suppose, they also do not tend to the friend.

⁴Hyland F& Hyland K,” Sugaring the pill: Praise and Criticism in Written Feedback. *journal of second language writing*.vol.10 2001, 325-333

⁵ Connors, R.J., & Lunsford,A. Teachers’ rhetorical comments on the students papers. *College compotition and communication*, Vol. 44,1993 p.200-223

Also, there are some significance to analysis the students' feedback through writing class, such as :

1. To know the students' problems and to know the students' competence. It can be known the students' problems by analyzing the students' feedback,
2. In this analysis it can also be found some students' problem ,
 - a. First, some students did not make their paragraph writing in specific and coherence it is based on some criticism feedback such as "your paragraph is too specific", "your sentence is not complete", "your paragraph is not suitable with the topic". Those some feedback were shown us that there are some students' problem in writing class.
 - b. Second, it could be known from peers about the students' competence in writing paragraph, how to know the students' competence by analyzing the student's feedback, if it can be found a lot of praises, it means the students' competence is good, but if it is found a lot of criticism or suggestion, it means their competence is low.

B. The result of questionnaire students' attitude toward getting peer feedback

There were divided into four categories of feedback, but here it was divided into five topic of questionnaire, those are students attitude about feedback, students attitude about praise, students' attitude toward criticism, students' attitude toward corrective. Those would be explained based on the topic.

Table 4.10

Percentage the Students' attitude toward feedback

No	Statement	Percentage of answer
----	-----------	----------------------

		SD	D	N	A	SA ⁶
1	"I look for several friends to give me written feedback in my writing"			10%	37%	53%
2	"I feel confidence to get feedback from close friend"			16%	37%	47%
3	"I rewrite my work when I get feedback from expert writer or new learner"		5%	42%	21%	32%
4	"Process of feedback makes me better in my writing"			11%	5%	84%
5	"Process of feedback is an interesting experience"			11%	26%	63%

For the first statement "I look for several friends to give me written feedback in my writing",

Based on the students answer above most of them are asking feedback to others about their writing, it can be seen 53% of student strongly agree and 37% agree with the asking of feedback, only 10% of student choose neutral for this question.

For the second statement " I feel confidence to get feedback from a close friend", the result above shows that 47% of the students strongly agree that they only ask feedback from a close friend, and 37% they agree about the statement above, and 16% the student do not chose whether agree or disagree.

For the thirds statement, "I rewrite when I get feedback from the expert writer or new writer", the students' answer above that from whoever they get feedback, they will rewrite 32% students choose they strongly agree, then 21% of student agree with this statement, and

⁶ SD: strongly disagree, D: Disagree, N: neutral, A: agree, SA: Strongly Agree

42% students they choose neutral, and only 5% students choose they do not agree with this statement.

For the fourth statement “process of peer feedback makes my writing better”, based on the students’ answer above, it proves that more than half of students or 84% of them state that they are very agree with the statement that process of peer feedback makes their writing better, and there are 5% agree with this statement. And 11% of students choose neutral about this statement.

For the fifth statement “ process of peer feedback is interesting experience”, based on the students’ answer above, it also proves that more than half of students or 63% of them state that they are very agree with the statement that process of peer feedback is interesting experience, and there are 26% agree with this statement. And 11% of students do not have choice or neutral about this statement

Table 4.11

The percentage of students’ Attitude toward criticism feedback

No	Statement	Percentage of answer				
		SD	D	N	A	SA
6	“I prefer to get criticism or negative feedback than positive feedback”			53%	26%	21%
7	“if my friend gives negative feedback I feel lazy to open my work”	42%	21%	27%	5%	5%
8	“criticism feedback makes me emotional”	16%	37%	26%	11%	10%

For the sixth statement “I prefer to get criticism or negative feedback rather than positive feedback”, from the table above, it shows a good phenomena, 53% of students state neutral about the statement they prefer to get negative feedback rather than positive feedback, it means they do not choose and do not comment about this statement, but 21% of students choose strongly agree and 26% of students choose agree with this statement. It means less half students agree they prefer to get criticism feedback. It also supports from the interview most of them choose getting criticism with they have reason that getting criticism makes their writing better.

The seventh statement “if my friend gives negative feedback I feel lazy to open my work”, from the chart above it shows that 42% of students strongly disagree that getting criticism feedback makes them lazy, and also 21% of students shows disagree with this statement. But 5% agree and 5% of students strongly agree with this statement. It can be concluded that they need criticism in their writing feedback.

The eight statement “criticism feedback makes me emotional”, based on the above chart, 37% of students state they disagree when they get criticism they feel emotional, and it adds 16% of students strongly disagree that criticism makes them emotional. But there are 11% of students agree and 10% of students strongly agree that getting criticism makes them emotional. And the rest 26% of student choose neutral.

Table 4.12

The percentage of students’ Attitude toward corrective feedback

No	Statement	Percentage of answer				
		SD	D	N	A	SA
9	“I appreciate written feedback which is about grammar”			16%	37%	47%

10	"I appreciate written feedback about contain"		5%	16%	37%	42%
11	"I like when my friend gives feedback which correct my mistake in writing"		6%	16%	38%	40%

The
ninth

statement "I appreciate written feedback which is about grammar", there are 47% of students strongly appreciate when they get feedback to correct about their grammar, and 37% of students also appreciate getting feedback about grammar. And the rest is neutral, it is for about 16% of students.

The tenth statement "I appreciate written feedback about contain", there are 42% state that they strongly agree when they get feedback and corrective their contain of writing, and also 37% of students agree with this statement. But 5% of student disagree when their friend give feedback about the contain. And 16 of students choose neutral about this issue.

The eleventh statement "I like when my friend gives feedback which correct my mistake in writing", based on the percentage above, there are 40% of students strongly agree with feedback which is correct their mistake or error word. And also 38% of students agree with this statement. Only 6% of students disagree about this issue. And the rest 16% of students choose neutral.

Table 4.13

The percentage of students' attitude toward praise feedback

No	Statement		Percentage of answer			
			SD	D	N	A
12	“getting praise makes me more serious”		5%	31%	32%	32%

13	"I feel happy when my friend says this is good work"			42%	32%	26%
14	"I am motivated when I get feedback from my friend that my writing is good"			11%	21%	68%

The twelfth statement "getting praise makes me more serious", based on the chart above, 32% of students state that they are more serious when they get praise feedback. and also supported 32% agree with this statement. But there is 5% of students disagree about this statement. And 31% of students state neutral or they do not choose.

The thirteenth statement "I feel happy when my friend says this is good work", there are 26% strongly agree and 32% agree of students choose that they feel happy when they get word "good work" from their friend. And it is also big percentage, there are 42% of students choose neutral.

The fourteenth statement "I am motivated when I get feedback from my friend that my writing is good", based on the percentage above, 32% students choose strongly agree when they get praise and they will do their work hard. But 31% they choose neutral, and only 5% students disagree with the statement above.

Table 4.14

The percentage of students' attitude toward suggestion feedback

No	Statement	Percentage of answer				
		SD	D	N	A	SA
15	"suggestion is more effective for me when I get feedback"		5%		42%	53%
16	"I feel happy when I get feedback and				5%	95%

	how is the solution”					
17	“By getting many suggestions , my writing will be better”				42%	58%

The fifteenth statement “suggestion is more effective for me when I get feedback”, the result above shows that 53% of students state that suggestion is more effective when they get feedback, it means they prefer to get suggestion for their work, it prove with 42% of students agree with this statement. And only 5% of students choose neutral.

The sixteenth statement “I feel happy when I get feedback and how is the solution”, it can be seen that the result of this question is absolute because 95% of students state that they like getting feedback and how the solution, so students not only want to get feedback, but also how to solve the mistake or the problem in their study. And only 5% of students choose neutral in this statement.

The seventeenth statement “By getting many suggestions , my writing will be better”, the result above shows that suggestion feedback is more effective when they get feedback, more than 50% of students. 98% Students feel happy when they get suggestion , 58% student think that when they get suggestion their writing will be better. So from the percentage above it can be conclude that most of student support when they get suggestion.

C. The result of Interview

Actually , interview is not the main process to get all of the data to answer the research question. But , the interview process is still important and needed to complete and confirm the data taken from observation and questionnaire.

The result of the interview process shows that the students’ attitude about feedback are :

1. They like doing peer feedback, from 19 student interviewed only 3 students said that peer feedback is not important, the rest they said peers is very important to have the writing be better.
2. From the interview the students said that they like getting criticism feedback for about 75% of students like criticism, they have some reasons such as “I like criticism because it makes my work better”. But some students said they like praise because it motivates their work, and also when they get praise they say that we should not be arrogant. Praise is not their favorite feedback, because they feel they still study, so they want to get more criticism feedback.
3. When they were asked about the advantage of reading their friends’ work: they mostly said they like reading their friends work, because they can learn from their friend, they can know the way their friends explain and write the paragraph, they also can be inspired from their friends’ work.
4. Students said that they get a lot of advantages doing peer feedback, these are some reasons they can study together correcting each other about the mistake, we can know their friends weakness about the paragraph. 76% of students said so about the beneficial of giving feedback. and only 26% of students think that feedback is not beneficial for them, it is because they should have extra time to have peers. And their time decrease because they only little time to get new lesson from lecture. And this is the table of the beneficial giving feedback in peers, it listed in the table below:

Table 4.15

The beneficial of giving feedback to their peers

No	The beneficial of giving feedback to their peers
1.	Feedback can be used as self reflection, and also share the idea
2.	With feedback, we can learn from our friend’s mistake

3	We can learn together, study together, and correct together
4	To make our work better, we can have peer feedback
5	To get references or to know the model of paragraph from our friends
6	To help us understand about the lesson
7	As the self correction
8	To share the knowledge from the lecture, or to make the same perception about our understanding
9	To check our understanding about the lesson
10	To improve our vocabulary and to know the structure and model of writing
11	To show our critical thinking

5. The last question was feedback useful, very useful or not useful, most student said that feedback is very useful to make the works are more perfect.

So from those some questions correlated with students' attitude toward getting peer feedback, It can be shown that almost the students like doing peer feedback to build their work better.

D. Discussion

According to Hyland and Hyland, there are three types of feedback. Three types of feedback are praise, criticism and suggestion ⁷. This research had analyzed students feedback based on those system of categorization. Based on the data analysis got from students' document after having peer feedback, it can be found three types of feedback (see the appendix 2) . Students had produced types of feedback. In the finding has been mentioned

⁷ Hyland.K and Hyland F. "*Feedback on second language students' writing*". (Cambridge University press 2006)

that students could produce 22 % praise feedback. And the result of peer feedback 36% criticism, , suggestion could be collected 27%. Different from Hyland and Hyland research⁸, they found 44% about praise and 31 % were related to criticism and 25% were related to suggestion. From those result it could be seen that there is different result from Hyland and Hyland's research, in that research the result is praise had been as dominant feedback, but this research, the result is criticism as the dominant result. This difference may be a result of the fact that Hyland and Hyland conducted study on teachers' feedback whereas this study focused on students' feedback. different from Hyland research.

This research also has another type of feedback, which is corrective feedback, it is special to correct the mistake of grammatical. Based on Roy and Leile, another type of feedback is corrective feedback⁹. The students who give feedback which is correlated with error grammatical, it is included in this type of feedback. The students could make 15% of corrective feedback.

According to Nancy's research, as the previous of study, praise feedback could be collected 5%, criticism could be collected 17%, and suggestion could be collected 78%¹⁰. If it compare with this research, the result is different which is criticism is dominant then, from Nancy's research, suggestion is dominant feedback. the result is different because of some reasons. First, she observed in Tokyo in science class whether this research is in writing class, second, it is because of different country and different social culture.

According to Rosetta, attitude has been defined as positive and negative action¹¹. To know the students attitude toward feedback, this research has done interview and giving

⁸ Hyland.K and Hyland F. "surgaring the pill: Praise and criticism in written feedback, *journal of second language writing*, vol 10, 2001, 18-212

⁹ Roy.L &Leila R(mcGill University and Concordia University). *Negotiation of form in Communicative Classrooms*. (printed in the United States of America1997).20.p.10

¹⁰ Nancy Shzh-chen LEE." Written peer feedback by EFL students : *praise, criticism, and suggestion* " (Cambodia journal of English education2007).

¹¹ Rosetta.Z. & Pietro D.M. "Attitude toward mathematics: *overcoming the positive/negative dichotomy*". (Pisa Italy.2003)p.3

questionnaire to the students. The result suggests that most of the students think that whatever the feedback they get, it is not a problem. But it has some reasons, they think that when they get negative feedback, it is to make their writing better, then when they get praise feedback, it is to support as motivation to make their writing the best. But 20% of students dislike when they get criticism feedback. It means that some students also do not expect to get criticism, it is also supported with the result of the interview in which 25% of students dislike when they get criticism.

According to Yang Badger, peer feedback is more beneficial than teacher feedback, it is because of some reasons, it can make students think freely and also make students to have good social interaction among them¹². Based on the questionnaire given, it could be collected 11 beneficial of feedback (see table 14.15) and it can be shown in the percentage 74% of the student answer that peer feedback help them, it means it is very beneficial for them, some students said it is beneficial because it can help them to make variety of their work, and also other friends work can be as their new reference how to write paragraph writing better. And 26% of students said that peer feedback is not beneficial based on their answer. They think that it is waste of time, when they do peers, the teacher's time was decrease, so teacher can not help them when they have problem in doing their work.

Finally, it can be concluded that there are four types of feedback found in this research, praise, criticism, suggestion, and corrective feedback. Then students attitude toward peer feedback they get is globally positive, and students feel that peer feedback is much beneficial for them based on the interview. So, it is important to do peer feedback and as recommendation teacher can do peer feedback and can give feedback based on the result of this research.

¹² Yang, M., Badger, R., & Yu, Z. "A comparative study of peer and teacher feedback in Chinese EFL writing class". *Journal of Second Language Writing*. Vol 15, Tokyo 2006, 179-200.