

CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

This chapter discusses about all of related review of the study. There are three main points that will be discussed, those are: definition of paraphrasing, criteria of appropriate paraphrase, and techniques in paraphrasing. In addition, some previous studies related to this linguistic field also will be revealed.

A. Definition of Paraphrase

As stated before paraphrase is one the important techniques in writing which student need to use as they write someone's work, ideas, and thought to support their argument.²¹ According to Merriam-Webster dictionary, a paraphrase (as a noun) is a restatement of a text, passage, or work, expressing the meaning of the original in another form by expressing, interpreting, or translating with latitude giving the meaning of a passage in another language. Similarly, paraphrasing (as a verb) is "the act or process of restating or rewording. In the light of these definitions, paraphrasing or "rewording of another writer's text, explanation, argument, or narrative" is approximately equal in length as the original but differs significantly in its lexis and syntax.²² From the lexical meaning above paraphrasing can be known as the statements of a text or passage restated by the writers.

Furthermore, Alice and Hogue on the book of Academic Writing define paraphrasing as follow:

"Paraphrasing is a writing skill in which you "rephrase" (rewrite) information from an outside source in your own words without changing its meaning. Because you include in your rewriting all, or nearly all, of the content

²¹ Bazerman, C. *The informed writer: Using sources in the disciplines*, 5th edition. (Princeton, NJ: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1995) p. 58

²² Merriam-Webster, *Students' Writing Handbook* 5th edition, 2010. p. 284

of the original passage, a paraphrase is almost as long”.²³

Many universities, university libraries, and university writing centers in offer information about paraphrasing on their websites. On these websites, paraphrases are defined and when, how, and why to use paraphrasing are explained. For example, a webpage by Purdue OWL explains paraphrasing as follows:

“Paraphrasing involves putting a passage from source material into your own words. A paraphrase must also be attributed to the original source. Paraphrased material is usually shorter than the original passage, taking a somewhat broader segment of the source and condensing it slightly”.²⁴

From this explanation, paraphrasing can be concluded as one of the techniques in academic writing needed to support writers’ statements in taking experts’ statements, in addition to strengthen opinion without removing the meaning of the statements. Moreover, this technique is aimed to avoid unintentional plagiarism called as inappropriate paraphrasing.

B. Criteria of Appropriate Paraphrase

To use paraphrasing techniques, writers need to cover some criteria of good paraphrasing which can be included as appropriate techniques. Some experts have argued the criteria in taking someone’s ideas through paraphrasing. Although different arguments revealed by some experts, the main criteria of paraphrasing are actually still in the same line or argument.

According to Alice, good criteria of paraphrase include all important ideas mentioned in the original passage but not in the same order.²⁵ Alice describes some appropriate paraphrase as below:

²³ Alice, O. & Ann Hogue, *Writing Academic English, Third Edition*, (Young Publishing House, 2000) p. 127

²⁴ Driscoll, D. L., & Brizee, A. *Quoting, paraphrasing, and summarizing*. (2013). Retrieved

from <https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/563/1/> accessed on 10 January 2017

²⁵ Alice, *Writing Academic English*... p. 129

1. Keep the length approximately the same as the original.
2. Do not stress any single point more than another.
3. Do not change the meaning by adding your own thoughts or views.
4. Do not use the original sentence structure.

For examples:

Original Passage:

Language is the main means of communication between people. But so many different languages have developed that language has often been a barrier rather than an aid to understanding among peoples. For many years, people have dreamed of setting up an international universal language which all people could speak and understand. The argument in favour of a universal language is simple and obvious. If all people spoke the same tongue, cultural and economic ties might be much closer, and good will might increase between countries (Kispert).²⁶

Appropriate Paraphrase:

Humans communicate through language. Because there are so many different languages, however, people around the world have a difficult time understanding one another. Some people have wished for a universal international language that speakers all over the world could understand. Their reasons are straightforward and clear. A universal language world builds cultural and economic bonds. It would also create better feelings among countries (Kispert).

²⁶ Kispert, Robert J. "Universal Language." World Book Online Reference Center. 2014

Inappropriate Paraphrase

Language is the principal means of communication between peoples. However, because there are numerous languages, language itself has frequently been a barrier rather than an aid to understanding among the world population. For many years, people have envisioned a common universal language that people in the world could communicate it. The reasons for having a universal language are clearly understandable. If the same tongue were spoken by all countries, they would undoubtedly become closer culturally and economically. It would probably also create good will among nations.

The last passage can be declared as inappropriate paraphrase because the source is not cited. Additionally, it could be plagiarism work because it is too similar to the original passage. The reasons of being plagiarism are because first sentence, only one word has been changed: *main* replaced by *principal* and the second sentence, only a few words have been changed. By only having a little changing whether in structure or in word order can be one of an inappropriate works because the text would be a quite similar to original passage.

Furthermore, Rinnert and Kobayashi describe the criteria of appropriate paraphrase the text or passage should be firstly included the correct citation convention. The, the sentence structure and word choice must be changed, and last the basic meaning of the text is retained.²⁷ Followed by Pennycook who claimed that borrowing others, words, or ideas should be acknowledging the source appropriately and including very little verbatim copying.²⁸

From these explanations, the criteria can be listed as bellow:

²⁷ Rinnert, C., & Kobayashi, H. *Borrowing words and ideas: Insights from Japanese LI writers*. (Journal of Asian Pacific Communication, 2005) 15(1), p. 31

²⁸ Pennycook, A. *Borrowing others' words: Text, ownership, memory, and plagiarism*. 1996 TESOL Quarterly, 30, 201-230.

- 1) The source is acknowledged using correct citation conventions
- 2) The sentence structure and word choice are altered
- 3) The basic meaning of the original text is retained
- 4) Including very little verbatim copying.

Example:

Original Text:

Sources: Page 16 of a three-page article in the October 15, 2003, issue of *Space Science* magazine. The title of the article is “Manned Mars Fight: Impossible Dream?” The author, Patrick Clinton, a NASA (National Aeronautics and Space Administration) physician
Living abroad a space station in orbit around Earth for months at a time poses problems for astronauts’ bodies as well as for their minds.²⁹

Inappropriate Paraphrase:

An article in *Space Science* reports that living in a space station orbiting Earth for a long time can cause difficulties for astronauts’ bodies and minds.

Appropriate Paraphrase:

An article in *Space Science* magazine reports that lengthy space station duty may lead to physical and mental problems for astronauts (Clinton 16).

This paraphrase is appropriate because some criteria covered as follow:

- a) The source is cited, (Clinton 16).
- b) The words changed, *for months* replaced by *lengthy*, *bodies* and *minds* replaced by *physical* and *mental*.
- c) The structure is also changed.
- d) The key meaning is retained, *Space Science magazine* and *problems*.

²⁹ Alice, *Writing Academic English*, p. 130-131

Based on Keck's study, to support arguments through paraphrase the text changed to writers' text should be mentioned the sources of the text or the author of the text. It also must be different from a quotation and summary. Moreover, he argued that appropriate paraphrase must change the word order into different types.³⁰ These requirements of using paraphrasing technique are the same as the previous experts' theories. In addition, Shirley on his study "*The Art of Paraphrase*" "gives more information about the criteria of appropriate paraphrase. He states that to use paraphrasing technique, writers must not distort the meaning of the original text, key point should be retained, and using sufficient synonym."³¹ This means he strengthens the criteria from the accurate meaning and the key words writers should precisely restate the original text.

Furthermore, Campbell on his journal "*Writing with Others' Words*" gives additional information that paraphrases must be involved syntactic changes of the original than near copy. It also contains the key points, in addition to have the detail sources.³² In the line with those characteristics, Purdue University Online Writing Lab (OWL) also suggests that text must be comprehended from the original expert, and all key details must be included.³³ Briefly, both Campbell and OWL categorize the appropriate criteria are typically near to syntactical changing and the word count.

From the explanation above, it can be concluded that appropriate paraphrasing can be measured by some criteria bellows:

1. Paraphrase must be different from quotation and summary.
2. Paraphrase must include the source of the text or the author of the text.
3. Paraphrase must retain the meaning of the text, by meaning that key details are mentioned, and it should not change the original meaning.

³⁰Keck, "*The Use of Paraphrase in Summary Writing*". p. 270

³¹Shirley, "*The Art of Paraphrase. Instructional Note*". p. 186-188

³²Campbell, *Writing with Others' Words*.... p. 211

³³Purdue OWL: *Quoting, Paraphrasing, and Summarizing*.

4. Paraphrasing text must be comprehended from the original text.
5. Paraphrasing text must change word order with sufficient use of synonym.
6. Paraphrase must be involved more syntactic changes than near copy.

These following examples are the paraphrase which can be included as appropriate or inappropriate based on the information from Keck's study, Shirley, and OWL Purdue Online Writing.

Original Text:

Americans consider someone who looks them in the eye to be honest. A person who looks down or looks away, in contrast, is suspected of being dishonest.³⁴

Appropriate Paraphrase:

For people from the US, not looking someone in the eye is an indication of not telling the truth, while meeting a person's eyes is a sign that they are telling the truth.

Inappropriate Paraphrase:

People from America seeing others by eyes mean they are honest. But people seeing down and far away are supposed dishonest.

All the explanation from some experts above shows that the criteria of appropriate paraphrase could be clarified as follow:

1. Attributed to Original Sources

The most important required element in paraphrasing is to include the sources from the original text. Making it completed with sources, writer can use several ways to ensure the text is such a paraphrase. This way is citing the

³⁴Doshisha University Academic Repository, <http://library.doshisha.ac.jp/ir/en/>, accessed 9 Jan 2017.

original author to the text which has been paraphrased.
Example:

Humans communicate through language. Because there are so many different languages, however, people around the world have a difficult time understanding one another. Some people have wished for a universal international language that speakers all over the world could understand. Their reasons are straightforward and clear. A universal language world builds cultural and economic bonds. It would also create better feelings among countries (Kispert).

2. **Sufficient Use of Synonym for Terminology**

Using synonym to take someone ideas is as important as citing the original sources. This criterion means that using synonym needs some criteria to achieve a sufficient one. As Stephen Bailey³⁵ stated that to avoid unconnected words, sufficient synonym should follow the rules as bellow:

- a. Synonym must be nearly similar to another word
- b. Synonym must be used in a context of the text
- c. Synonym must be expressed without a change of the overall message

Example:

Original Text:

Americans consider someone who looks them in the eye to be honest. A person

³⁵ Stephen Bailey, *Academic Writing: A Handbook for International Students*, 2 edition (London; New York: Routledge, 2006), p. 29–31.

who looks down or looks away, in contrast, is suspected of being dishonest.³⁶

Appropriate Paraphrase:

For people from the US, not looking someone in the eye is an indication of not telling the truth, while meeting a person's eyes is a sign that they are telling the truth.

3. Retaining All Key Points of Original Excerpt

Every statement will always have the main topic which is discussed about. This is such a topic that cannot be deleted from the original one when taking someone ideas. Someone paraphrasing can change the words but cannot replace the key points of the text. As Jordan argued this means the *topic sentence* and *controlling idea* should always be retained.³⁷

Original Text:

Living abroad a space station in orbit around Earth for months at a time poses problems for astronauts' bodies as well as for their minds.³⁸

Appropriate Paraphrase:

An article in *Space Science* magazine reports that lengthy space station duty may lead to physical and mental problems for astronauts (Clinton 16).

4. Sufficient Syntactical Shift

This means that paraphrasing should be applied in changing the structure of grammar. There are two ways which can be used to change the structure. Those are:

1. Active to passive

³⁶ Doshisha University Academic Repository, <http://library.doshisha.ac.jp/ir/en/>, accessed 9 Jan 2017.

³⁷ R. Jordan. *Academic Writing Course: Study Skill in English*, 3rd edition. (Oxford: Pearson Education, 2003). p. 93-98

³⁸ Alice, *Writing Academic English*, p. 131

2. Positive to negative
3. Long sentence to short sentence

Examples:

Original:

“Americans consider someone who looks them in the eye to be honest. A person who looks down or looks away, in contrast, is suspected of being dishonest.”³⁹

Paraphrase:

For people from the US, not looking someone in the eye is an indication of not telling the truth, while meeting a person's eyes is a sign that they are telling the truth.

5. Avoided Summary

Since paraphrasing is not a summary, it should be stated different from a summary. The differences between them are:

- a) A summary is an abridged version of the original text
- b) A paraphrase can be shorter or longer than original text
- c) A summary eliminates detail, examples, and supporting points
- d) A paraphrase describes the original text in different words. It does not omit detail

6. Word Form Changed

Changing word order is quite similar to changing a structure of grammar. However, it could be separated from

³⁹Alice, *Writing Academic English*, p. 131

the previous one because this only focuses on a changing in particular position of each sentence.⁴⁰

- Original : Terry wanted more books, but he couldn't afford them.
- Paraphrase : Terry couldn't afford more books, even though he wanted them.

7. No Writers' Opinion

As a writer who takes someone ideas, it is very necessary to know that including our opinion in a paraphrase cannot be applied. This means that all the text must contain only an idea from the original sources.

Many studies and experts argued the measurement of appropriateness paraphrase since they have found and measured the criteria by their own perspective. All the criteria provided by some studies are obviously acceptable and no other reasons to claim those theories. From those theories, the researcher aims to use and collect their arguments to become the measurement of the appropriate paraphrase. According to Keck's study, the appropriate paraphrase rubric has been stated by Shirley and Purdue Online Writing Lab, and they stated that the level of paraphrase can be categorized into four types. Those are *appropriate paraphrase*, *somewhat appropriate*, *somewhat inappropriate*, and *inappropriate*.⁴¹ Keck took the criteria which were adapted from Shirley and OWL who collected some theories to support their arguments. Having a theoretical discussion and adapting some recent information from English for academic, they synthesized these aforementioned guidelines and considered purposing a set of required criteria within a checklist for paraphrase appropriateness.⁴²

C. Techniques of Paraphrase

Some experts have argued that taking other's words through paraphrase there are some ways to entirely accomplish this

⁴⁰ Shirley, "The Art of Paraphrase. Instructional Note". p. 186

⁴¹ Keck, "The Use of Paraphrase in Summary Writing" p. 265

⁴² Shirley, "The Art of Paraphrase. Instructional Note". p. 186

technique. According to McGinley, techniques in paraphrasing are divided into three groups: changing structure and grammar paraphrase (syntactic paraphrase), changing word paraphrase (semantic paraphrase) and changing structure (organization) of ideas.⁴³ Bailey also declares that the way to paraphrase other's words can be done through three different ways, such as changing word order, changing word category, and changing structure of idea.⁴⁴ There no different argument between those two experts involved the way to paraphrase. On the other hand, Jordan has a view of this topic with three different techniques to paraphrase. Those are changing the vocabulary, changing the verb form, and changing the word class.⁴⁵

From all those information and arguments from some experts, it can be concluded there are three main techniques in paraphrasing, as explained below:

1) **Changing Structure and Grammar**

As Jordan said that a paraphrase can be firstly used by changing the word order of the sentence or the passage by starting at a different place: in the middle or from the end of the original.⁴⁶ This technique aims to make the text different from the original in line with the position of each word. Jordan specified this way into two different types, those are: changing an active into passive, and changing a negative one into a positive one. Besides, it might be also broken up long sentences, combined short ones, expanded phrases for clarity, or shorten them for conciseness.⁴⁷

a) Active versus Passive

First way which can be used to paraphrase is changing an active form into a passive one. This can be

⁴³ McGinley. *The Role of Reading and Writing while Composing from Sources. Reading Research Quarterly*, vol. 27, (1992)p. 233.

⁴⁴ Stephen Bailey, *Academic Writing: A Handbook for International Students*, 2nd edition. (New York: Routledge, 2006), p. 30

⁴⁵ R. Jordan. *Academic Writing Course: Study Skill in English*, 3rd edition. (Oxford: Pearson Education, 2003). p. 93-98

⁴⁶ R. Jordan. *Academic Writing Course*, p. 94

⁴⁷ Stephen Bailey, *Academic Writing*, p. 29

done by put the subject of the original words to the object in paraphrase sentence.

Examples:

- Original:

People who really need to drink have a high level of intake but a lower level of satisfaction than people who can take it or leave it.⁴⁸

- Paraphrase:

A person who is addicted to alcohol consumes more but gets less pleasure than a person who drinks just to be sociable.

b) Positive versus Negative

This technique means that the prolog is changed into a negative in relation with lexical meaning. Not only does it change from the form of negative but also it can be done by putting the negative meaning and on the contrary. While if only it is changed in a form the text will be brought in different meaning. Therefore, changing a form and lexical meaning is undeniably necessary.

- Original:

Americans consider someone who looks them in the eye to be honest. A person who looks down or looks away, in contrast, is suspected of being dishonest.⁴⁹

- Paraphrase:

For people from the US, not looking someone in the eye is an indication of not telling the truth, while meeting a person's eyes is a sign that they are telling the truth.

⁴⁸Doshisha University Academic Repository, <http://library.doshisha.ac.jp/ir/en/>, accessed 9 Jan 2017.

⁴⁹Doshisha University Academic Repository, <http://library.doshisha.ac.jp/ir/en/>, accessed 9 Jan 2017.

c) Long Sentence to Short Sentences

The third technique means that making a long sentence to a short sentence by reducing some words which are not included as key points of the text. As Keck said on his study, shortening the text may be needed but retaining the meaning is completely more essential.⁵⁰

- Original:

Although our human ability to communicate is genetically determined and hence is a part of our biological nature, speech development importantly affected by the environment.

- Paraphrase:

- 1) The ability for human communication is biologically based.
- 2) The ability for human communication is transmitted through genes.
- 3) Environment also influences how human communication level.

d) Expand Phrases for Clarity

Expanding the phrase is aimed to make the clarification of the phrase itself. Sometimes writer only delivers an idea using implied meaning, so that another writer who takes the original word can use this technique to clarify the text. This is also used to strengthen a fact to the reader.⁵¹

Example:

- Original:

A college student usually has homework to do.⁵²

- Paraphrase:

A person going to college typically has to study at home.

⁵⁰Keck, "The Use of Paraphrase in Summary Writing"

⁵¹Stephen Bailey, *Academic Writing*, p. 30

⁵²Adam, W. B., Lark & Eric Williamson, *Building Skills for the TOEFL iBT: Beginning*; (Original Edition, Compass Publishing, 2006) .33

The word “typically” is the synonym of “usually” but it is more convenience. Writer also included the word “has to” which aims to strengthen the writer opinion.

e) Shorten Phrases for Conciseness

Previous technique elaborates the text which is expanded from the original, but this technique, on the contrary, makes the text shorter than original one. This aims to make unclear data and information clarified by only state the short text using the key detail information. Shirley believes that readers would be more confused to see more words in the text, in addition to make them trapped by some unimportant words. Therefore, he suggests to paraphrase other’s word by shortening the meaning and retaining the key points.⁵³

- Original:

In 1610, Galileo published a small book describing astronomical observations that he had made of the skies above Padua. His homemade telescopes had less magnifying and resolving power than most beginners’ telescopes sold today (1) yet with them he made astonishing discoveries (2) that the moon has mountains and other topographical features; that Jupiter is orbited by satellites, which he called planets; and that the Milky Way is made up of individual stars (3).⁵⁴

- Paraphrase:

Galileo was able to make some amazing discoveries with his telescope (2). He made discoveries about the moon, about Jupiter, and about the Milky Way (3). He was able to do this with a telescope that was less

⁵³Shirley, “The Art of Paraphrase. Instructional Note”. p. 187

⁵⁴ Shi, L. Textual borrowing in second-language writing. *Written Communication*, 21(2), 2004. 171-200.

powerful than even today's most basic telescopes (1).

In paraphrasing text, the writer brings the original text to a shorter text. It contains more simply but still retaining original meaning. The writer, additionally, puts another technique in this text, changing a structure of the text. By seeing a paraphrasing text, the readers would feel easier to catch the points.

2) Changing Word

The second main technique of paraphrase is changing the word. The technique can be used in two different ways such as changing word order and changing the word class or part of speech. In line with this statement, Hedgcock describes two ways of changing word are both in word order and word class.⁵⁵ Additionally, using synonym is an important way to paraphrase through this technique. Writer would be easier to use such this technique because they would not loss the key points of the text.⁵⁶

a) Changing Word Order

Bailey stated that one way to change a sentence for paraphrasing is to change the word order.⁵⁷ Some experts also argued that changing word order is quite similar to changing a structure of grammar. However, it could be separated from the previous one because this only focuses on a changing in particular position of each sentence.⁵⁸

Original : Because I slept too late, I missed my first class

Paraphrase : I missed my first class because I slept too late.

⁵⁵ Hedgcock, J. S. *Teaching readers of English: Students, texts, and contexts*. (New York: Routledge. 2009) p. 112

⁵⁶ McGinley. *The Role of Reading and Writing while Composing from Sources*. p. 233.

⁵⁷ Bailey, *Academic Writing*, p. 29.

⁵⁸ Shirley, "The Art of Paraphrase. Instructional Note".

It is sometimes necessary to change the wording of the parts of the sentences.

Original : Terry wanted more books, but he couldn't afford them.

Paraphrase : Terry couldn't afford more books, even though he wanted them.

b) Changing Parts of Speech

This way is to change the word class become another word class. If the sentence uses a noun, it can be rewritten to use the verb or adjective form of the word, for example.

Original : "Fifty-four men signed the Declaration of Independence."⁵⁹

Paraphrase : Fifty-four men put their signatures on the Declaration of Independence.

Also, to paraphrase we can change some of the words to their definitions, to synonyms or to antonyms. Using definitions, synonyms and antonyms help avoid unnecessary repetition of the same words.

1) *Paraphrase using synonyms*

Original : "The U.S. government has an enormous debt."⁶⁰

Paraphrase: The federal government has an extremely large debt.

2) *Paraphrase using definitions*

Original : "A college student usually has homework to do."⁶¹

Paraphrase: *People taking college courses usually have assignments to do.*

3) *Paraphrasing using antonyms*

Original : "Shaun was disappointed, because the movie wasn't very good."⁶²

⁵⁹R. Jordan. *Academic Writing Course*, p. 94

⁶⁰Bailey, *Academic Writing*, p. 29

⁶¹R. Jordan. *Academic Writing Course*, p. 94

⁶²Adam, W. B., Lark & Eric Williamson, *Building Skills for the TOEFL iBT: Beginning*.
33

Paraphrase: Shaun wasn't satisfied, because the movie wasn't very good.

3) Changing Structure of Ideas

Changing the structure of an idea means writer could elaborate the text by rewriting the statement in context of the position.

Original:

Statements that seem complimentary can go in one context may be inappropriate in another (1). For example, women in business are usually uncomfortable if male colleagues or superiors compliment them on their appearance (2): the comments suggest that the women are being treated as visual decoration rather than as contributing workers (3).⁶³

Paraphrase:

Women may feel uneasy upon receiving ordinarily positive comments on their appearance from male coworkers or supervisors (2). To these women, the remarks carry an implied meaning: instead of being thought of as productive employees, they are actually being viewed as just a pretty part of the atmosphere (3). Depending on the situation, words or expressions which appear favorable may actually be unsuitable in a conversation (1).

D. Differences of Paraphrasing, Quoting, and Summarizing

As opposed to quotations, which should be used sparingly, paraphrases and summaries will be used frequently in your academic writing to support your ideas. A paraphrase is a writing skill in which you “rephrase” (rewrite) information from an outside source in your own words without changing its meaning.

⁶³ Locker, K. O. *Business and administrative communication* (6th ed.). (St. Louis, MO: Irwin/McGraw-Hill, 2003). 323

Because you include in your rewriting all, or nearly all, of the content of the original passage, a paraphrase is almost as long. A summary, by contrast, is much shorter than the original. A summary includes only the main ideas of someone else's writing, restated in your own words. In summarizing and paraphrasing, however, you must not change the meaning of the original.⁶⁴

Original:

“Language is the main means of communication between peoples. But so many different languages have developed that language has often been a barrier rather than an aid to understanding among peoples. For many years, people have dreamed of setting up an international, universal language which all people could speak and understand. The arguments in favour of a universal language are simple and obvious. If all peoples spoke the same tongue, cultural and economic ties might be much closer, and good will might increase between countries.”

Quotation:

“Language is the main means of communication between peoples. But so many different languages have developed that language has often been a barrier rather than an aid to understanding among peoples. For many years, people have dreamed of setting up an international, universal language which all people could speak and understand. The arguments in favour of a universal language are simple and obvious. If all peoples spoke the same tongue, cultural and economic ties might be much closer, and good will might increase between countries.”⁶⁵

⁶⁴ Alice, O. & Ann Hogue, *Writing Academic English*, p. 129

⁶⁵Kispert, Robert J. “*Universal Language*.”

Paraphrase:

Humans communicate through language. However, because there are so many languages in the world, language is an obstacle rather than an aid to communication. For a long time, people have wished for an international language that speakers all over the world could understand. A universal language would certainly build cultural and economic bonds. It would also create better feelings among countries.⁶⁶

In this paraphrase passage, synonyms are used to replace original words (underlined) and sentence structures have been changed:

- ❖ “Language is the main means of communication between peoples”
→ Humans communicate through language.
- ❖ “But so many different languages have developed that language has often been a barrier rather than an aid to understanding among peoples”.
→ However, because there are so many languages in the world, language is an obstacle rather than an aid to communication.
- ❖ “For many years, people have dreamed of setting up an international, universal language which all people could speak and understand”.
→ For a long time, people have wished for an international language that speakers all over the world could understand.
- ❖ “If all peoples spoke the same tongue, cultural and economic ties might be much closer, and good will might increase between countries”
→ A universal language would certainly build cultural and economic bonds. It would also create better feelings among countries.

Summary:

⁶⁶Alice, O. & Ann Hogue, *Writing Academic English*, p. 129

People communicate mainly through language; however, having so many different languages creates communication barriers. Some think that one universal language could bring countries together culturally and economically and also increase good feelings among them.

Compare the summary with the paraphrase, we can see that some details are omitted from the summary that are included in the paraphrase: that people have dreamed of setting up an international, universal language, the arguments are simple and obvious. However, the meaning of the original has not been changed.

E. Previous Studies

Studies related to students' paraphrases in proposal writing had been conducted by other researchers. The followings are views of some researchers which were related to this research.

A research related to paraphrase had been conducted by Tra Thi My Dung entitled "*An Investigation in Paraphrasing Experienced by Vietnamese Students of English in Academic Writing*". The research can be the basic information for this study. The main purpose of the research was to investigate paraphrases on graduation papers from undergraduate students of Da Nang University. Specifically, this research investigated some important features of paraphrasing; students' preference and difficulties of paraphrasing; students' awareness and avoidance of plagiarism. It also identified the most common mistakes appearing in the students' paraphrasing. Towards the end of the research, 77,5 % of fourth years students at the college of Foreign Language – University of Da Nang made mistakes in paraphrasing, where 40% made mistake in changing structure and grammar, 22,5 % in changing word and 15% fall into plagiarism.⁶⁷

Quite different from the first previous study, a research conducted by Lara McInnis is entitled *Analyzing English L1 and*

⁶⁷ Tra Thi My Dung, MA Thesis: "*An Investigation in Paraphrasing Experienced by Vietnamese Students of English in Academic Writing*" (Danang: University of Da Nang, 2010)

L2 Paraphrasing Strategies through Concurrent Verbal Report and Stimulated Recall Protocols. This research can also be the basic information of this study since it analyzed the appropriateness of paraphrases. The research was to examine and analyzed 35 paraphrases written by 4 English-Canadian students and 5 Japanese international students at an English-medium community college in Ontario. The researcher evaluated paraphrase quality through analytic method and analyzed paraphrase appropriateness through a set of criteria he had developed. Then, he also analyzed 6 concurrent and post-task reports of 3 L1 and 3 L2 students, who used a variety of paraphrasing strategies. As the conclusion of this research, all participants wrote relatively inappropriate paraphrases which did not always correspond with perceived appropriateness. L1 students tended to copy directly from the original text excerpts more often than the L2 students did. Implications for teaching and further research are discussed.⁶⁸

Yoke Len Loh conducted a research entitled “*Errors in Paraphrasing and Strategies in Overcoming Them*”. The main purpose of the research was to identify the errors related to paraphrased content. To reduce these errors, the researcher used the preventive measures such as effective pedagogic strategies and learning activities. The subjects were 50 undergraduates taking an English academic reading and writing course at a Malaysian public university. The data comprised 95 answers to two questions on paraphrasing in the final examination paper for this course. The results revealed errors at three levels, namely linguistics (grammar, syntax, and lexis), conventions (writing and paraphrasing), and semantics (content of message). In addition, there was evidence of plagiarism in the subjects’ answers.⁶⁹

Another research related to paraphrases was conducted by Wahyuni Khairunnisa, Y.Gatot Sutapa.Y, and Surmiyati. The research was entitled “*Students’ Problem in Paraphrasing*”. This

⁶⁸ Lara McInnis, Thesis: “*Analyzing English L1 and L2 Paraphrasing Strategies through Concurrent Verbal Report and Stimulated Recall Protocols*” (University of Toronto, 2009)

⁶⁹ Yoke Len Loh, “*Errors in Paraphrasing and Strategies in Overcoming Them*”, University of Malaysia Sabah, Volume 1, Number 1, 2013

research was centered on the identification of students' ability in paraphrasing and the problems faced. The researcher used a case study in investigating the paraphrases from seventh semester students in Seminar on ELT class academic year. It was also conducted with aims to find out the causes of the problems in paraphrasing. In collecting the data, the research instruments needed were paraphrasing test, questionnaire and interview. The finding of the data analysis showed 76.92% of the students' ability in paraphrasing qualified in unsatisfactory level. From the test, it was found that 76.92% of the students made mistake in changing the order of ideas, while 76.92% respondents of the questionnaire and 80% of interviewees mentioned changing word as their problem in paraphrasing. The different result of the instruments was caused by the students' lack of understanding toward the criteria of a good paraphrasing. Furthermore, lack of vocabulary and understanding about paraphrasing discovered as the causes of the students' problems in paraphrasing.⁷⁰

In link to plagiarism study, paraphrase plagiarism had been found in students' proposal writing which was conducted by Nur Habibah in her thesis; *An Analysis of Plagiarism in Seminar Proposal by The Eight Semester Students of PBI UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya*. This study described the plagiarism forms within students' proposal. Analysing the data by qualitative approach, the researcher found that plagiarism really occurred in students' seminar proposal. One of the plagiarism form appeared in their proposals is paraphrase plagiarism. It means that the writers had successfully rewritten the ideas that they cited but they did not credit any sources. Another paraphrase plagiarism form is too perfect paraphrase. This means that the writers copies word-for-word of an author's argument and cites the sources properly but does not give quotation marks within the argument that has been copied word-for-word.⁷¹

Furthermore, a study related to paraphrase plagiarism had been conducted by Rastri Dewi Savitri in her thesis entitled

⁷⁰ Wahyuni Khairunnisa, "Students' Problems in Paraphrasing" (Pontianak, University of Tanjungpura, 2013)

⁷¹ Nur Habibah Thesis, *An Analysis of Plagiarism in Seminar Proposal* at UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya (Surabaya: State Islamic University of SunanAmpel, 2013) p. 68-71

“Plagiarism in Proposal Writing Course at UIN Sunan Ampel English Education Department Surabaya”. This study had found one of the plagiarism types which correlated to paraphrase. To find plagiarism work of students’ proposal, the researcher used qualitative and quantitative method. As one of the results on her finding, an inadequate paraphrase (67.57%) commonly appeared in students’ proposal writing.⁷²

From all previous studies mentioned above, there are variety of differences between those researches and this research. Most of the researches tended to focus on the mistakes in paraphrasing and error of paraphrasing. Determining common problems when paraphrasing was likely more remarkable rather than analyzing each criteria of good paraphrase which met with students’ paraphrases. Particularly, this study only focuses on paraphrase appropriateness in proposal writing. Classifying students’ paraphrase to appropriateness levels; *appropriate*, *somewhat appropriate*, *somewhat inappropriate*, and *inappropriate*. Those levels are determined by analyzing the criteria of appropriate paraphrase met with each paraphrase using a checklist adapted from Shirley and OWL Purdue. In addition, this study focuses on the technique that students mostly use in their paraphrase. For the second previous study, it is also different with my study.

⁷² Dewi Rastri Savitri Thesis, *Plagiarism in Proposal Writing Course* at UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya (Surabaya: State Islamic University of SunanAmpel, 2016) p. 75