48

CHAPTER IV

THE INTERPRETATION OF BOTH

HAMKA AND OURAISH SHIHAB ABOUT JILBAB

A. Hamka Interpretation About Jilbab

Alllah said about jilbab in the Holy Quran once. It is Surah al-Ahzab verse: 59. Then it well-known as jilbab verse. The verse is:

"Prophet! Tell your wives and daughters, and the believing women, that they should cast their outer garments over their persons (when abroad). That is most convenient, that they should be known (as such) and not molested. And God is oft-forgiving. Most Merciful."57

Hamka said when he interpreted this verse:

"di dalam ayat ini Raslullah diperintahkan oleh Tuhan supaya memerintahkan pula kepada isteri-isterinya dan anak-anaknya yang perempuan. Setelah itu ialah kepada isteri-isteri orang yang beriman. Supaya kalau mereka keluar rumah hendaklah memakai jilbab." 58

By this verse the prophet of Muhammad was obligated by God to order his wives and his daughters, and the believing wives to cast their outer garment over when they go out of home.

In this great work, Hamka did not explain the vocabularies meaning of the text word by word. Although his Arabic knowledge was undoubtedly, he

⁵⁷ Abdullah Yousuf Ali. The Glorious Kur'an Translation and Commmentary. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr p: 11126-1127 ⁵⁸ Hamka. *Tafsir al-Azhar*. Juz XXII p: 94

just wrote the meaning of the main word. It is jilbab. When Hamka gave meaning of it, he excerpted opinions of some interpreters whose reputable expert and deepen knowledge in Quranic exegesis. The word jalab is plural of jilbab. These are some meaning of jilbab. The author of Tafsir al-Azhar excerpted the opinion of al-Qurthubi about jilbab is "it is wider than stole" then he added " a long cloth covering the whole body". In the others hand Ibnu Abbas and Ibnu Mas'ud, both companions of prophet Muhammad peace be upon him whose deepen knowledge said that jilbab is rida' like loose blanket. A other opinion is excerpted from Ibnu Katsir: "jilbab is covering body on stole.⁵⁹ From the opinions above it can be concluded that the meaning of jilbab is a garment worn by women to cover whole of body that is longer than stole or blanket.

Hamka did not study about *Ulumul Quran* in the formal education, but he was provided with reputable expert in Arabic Language so that he can deepen kind of Islamic knowledge autodidact. His attention to Quranic Science in interpreting Quranic verse looked when he interpreted the purpose of the order to wear *jilbab* out of dresses. It is a proof that they are respectable women and independent. They are not slave, lady in waiting, and prostitute women. It has been explained on the background of verses revealing that before this verse was revealed, the woman of Makah went out to street for looking for place where they defecate at midnight. At that time the criminal disturbed them. When they looked at them wearing jilbab they would not

⁵⁹ Ibid p: 96

disturb them, they said; "Don't disturb these independent woman", but when they looked at them did not wear *jilbab* they said: "She is slave!!" then they crowd around her.

Thus *jilbab* is woman dress code that show high polite and modesty. Therefore all of believing woman should to leave *jahiliyyah* dresses those visible genitals as like *koteka* (penis sheath of irian) a traditional dress in Irian Jaya that cover sex organ only and make shy polite people who see whom wear it. Or *kebaya* of Java mode that open some chest and without covering with *sarong* or close dresses of Minang is tighten fitting until visible the whole of body as like as winding snake.

But, how is the form of *jilbab* that has been intended by Islam. Hamka who finished his higher work of exegesis in custody of old order explained that;

"Dalam ayat yang kita tafsirkan ini jelaslah bahwa pakaian atau modelnya tidaklah ditentukn oleh al-Quran. Yang jadi pokok yang dikehendaki al-Quran ialah pakaian yang menunjukkan iman kepada Tuhan, pakaian yang menunjukkan kesopanan, bukan yang memperagakan badan untuk jadi tontonan laki-laki. 60

"On the verse that has been interpreted by us, explained that Alqur'an does no determine the shape and the mode of dress. The main point that intended by Alqur'an is dress which reflect the belief of god and politeness, not the dress that show the bodies to man".

According to Hamka interpretation the shape of *jilbab* was not determined clearly by Alqur'an but he gave some criteria should be filled by

_

⁶⁰ Ibid p: 98

woman when they wear *jilbab*. These criteria's are, loose and covering the genitals. Al-Quran has explained about genital in Surah an-Nur verse 30-31. The quranic verse that explained the limit of genitals special for women is surah an-Nur verse 31.

...that they should not display their beauty and ornaments except what (must ordinarily) appear thereof; that they should draw their veils over their bosoms...⁶¹

The warning for woman, they not only should save eyesight and keep sex organ, but also keep their beauty and ornament except what (must ordinary) appear thereof; such ring of finger, face, and hand. Those ornaments are ordinary visible they are simple and no striking. They also should draw their veils over their bosoms and not display their beauty and ornaments except to whom are permitted by Islam to see, as explained in this verse.

In interpretting Quranic verses Hamka not only based on his mind and thinking. He also took notice to Prophet Muhammad peace be upon him (Hadits), the opinion of thabi'n, narration based on believed exegesis books such al-Manar and Mafatih al-Gayb, and some poetries such poetry of Moh.Ikbal. According to Hamka the meaning of زينة that was intended in this verse as like as the narration of A'isyah a wife of Prophet Muhammad:

حَدَّثَنَا يَعْقُوبُ بْنُ كَعْبِ الأَنْطَاكِيُّ وَمُؤَمَّلُ بْنُ الْفَضْلِ الْحَرَّانِيُّ قَالاَ حَدَّثَنَا الْوَلِيدُ عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ بَشِيرٍ عَنْ قَتَادَةَ عَنْ خَالِدٍ – قَالَ يَعْقُوبُ ابْنُ دُرَيْكٍ – عَنْ عَائِشَةَ رضى الله عنها أَنَّ أَسْمَاءَ بِنْتَ أَبِى بَكْرٍ دَخَلَتْ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ –صلى الله عليه وسلم– وعَلَيْهَا

digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id

⁶¹ Q.S Surah al-Ahzab verse 59

ثِيَابٌ رِقَاقٌ فَأَعْرَضَ عَنْهَا رَسُولُ اللّهِ –صلى الله عليه وسلم– وَقَالَ « يَا أَسْمَاءُ إِنَّ الْمَرْأَةَ إِذَا بَلَغَتِ الْمَحِيضَ لَمْ تَصْلُحْ أَنْ يُرَى مِنْهَا إِلاَّ هَذَا وَهَذَا ». وَأَشَارَ إِلَى وَجْهِهِ وَكَفَّيْه. ٢٠.

"O"Asma', when a women reaches the age of menstruation, it does not suit her that displays her parts of body except this and this (and he pointed to his face and hand)"

So that limit of woman genital under Hamka interpretation of this verse is whole of their body except two hands and face. As prophet Muhammad said to Asma binti Abu Bakar as Shiddiq.

Hamka was a writer whose many works in histories, literatures, tasawwuf, and religion said that these limits must become guidance to make mode of dresses. It is because Al-Quran do not determine clearly how to cut dresses, Al-Quran is not book of mode. Al-Quran never closed aesthesis of human being and their artistic Islam is belief of human being from west to east. At Pakistan and Scandinavia. The shape of dresses mode is according to the people based on the places and times. Islam just emphasizes the guidance in the heart and why of behaving that was established by polite faith. The shape and the mode of dresses is part of culture and the culture was established by place and time with smartness.

The Islamic warning to all of believers, man or woman lower the gaze, keep the honesty and the sex organ. Not show the ornament and the beauty by wearing *jilbab* and draw their veils over their bosoms.

digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id

⁶² Sunan Abi Dawud. Chapter: 12, p:169

In writing this exegesis book al-Azhar, Hamka used sociological approach (al-Adabi al-Ijtima'I) to interpret the Qur'anic verses in order the Indonesian whose complex and plurality characters can understand the interpretation and explanation of Quran correctly and easily. In this book tafsir al-Azhar, he also mentioned some practices of *jilbab* in Indonesia that has been intended by Islam.

When Hamka came to Tanjung Pura and Pangkalan Berandan on 1926, he met women there worn *jilbab*. It is a cloth covered the whole of body and just opened part of their faces. When they came out to meet their family in the other home, they covered their bodies with sarong and one of their hands touched the cloth into their faces, so that it just half of their faces opened, moreover just eyes.

It also happened when he came to Makassar 1931, the women who came from Salayer went in great numbers to place that they worked as slave. They chose coffee in Huber at Sulawesi. The entire women wore *jilbab* as like as in Langkat at the time. He also found same case when he came to Bhima on 1956 and n Gorontalo on 1967. The women of Gorontalo wore *jilbab* outside of their dresses, although they wore modern skirt as dresses of inside. The Aisyiyah movement in Java not only wore shawl (*khimar*) that wound around their chest in order not opened, but also wore veil thet covered their head. Moreover when he came to Yogyakarta on 1924 in addition they wore shawl and *khimar* to cover hea and chest, they were wearing *jilbab* out

side. This dress code spread in the entire of Indonesia. That all the practice of wearing *jilbab* that spread in Indonesia as like as mentioned in tafsir al-Azhar.

From the interpretation of Hamka about *jilbab* verses, it might be concluded generally into three points. Firstly, *Jilbab* is the Islamic dress code that has been ordered by Allah to wives of Prophet Muhammad saw, his daughters, the entire women of believers. Secondly, the order of *jilbab* is a proof that they are respectable women and independent. They are not slaves, prostitute women, or lady in waiting.

B. Quraish Shihab Interpretation About Jilbab

M.Quraish Shihab is well-known Indonesian interpreter who has many works in Quranic exegesis. One of his works that has been became reference by Indonesian Muslim to understand the meaning and the interpretation of al-Quran is Tafsir al-Misbah. It not only can be benefit from academic circles or whom study and wrestle with Quranic exegesis, but also it is provided generally for society. In this great work has been written the interpretation of Quraish about the dress code of muslim women. His interpretation about *jilbab* is different with Hamka and the most of interpreters and scholars those said that wearing *jilbab* is God order to women of believers.

When, he interpreted Surah al-Ahzab verse 59 in his book tafsir al-Misbah, Quraish started by explaining the meaning of vocabularies word by word. The word *jilbab* in this verse has been debatable among Islamic

Scholars. Quraish excerpted some opinions of them such al-Biqa'I who said that *jilbab* is loose dress or veil or outer garment covering dress and veil. And Thahir Ibn 'Asyur who understood *jilbab* as a dress is smaller than cloak and wider than veil and headscarf. But in the last Quraish did not prefer to one of the opinions. Furthermore he said that Allah did not order women of believers to wear *jilbab*. This is his opinion as has been written in al-Misbah:

"Ayat di atas tidak memerintahkan wanita muslimah memakai jilbab, karena agaknya ketika itu sebagian mereka telah memakainya, hanya saja cara memakainya belum mendukung apa yang dikehendaki ayat ini. Kesan ini diperoleh dari redaksi ayat di atas yang menyatakan jilbab mereka dan yang diperintahkan adalah "Hendaklah mereka mengulurkannya." Ini berarti mereka telah memakai jilbab tetapi belum lagi mengulurkannya Nah, terhadap mereka yang telah memakai jilbab, tentu lebih-lebih lagi yang belum memakainya, Allah berfirman: "Hendaklah mereka mengulurkan jilbabnya."

"This verse has not order the women of believers to wear jilbab. It might happen because some of women had worn jilbab at that time, on condition that they had not worn it as possible as al-Quran has established. The massege was taken from text of verse "their jilbab"(جلابيبهن) and the order "They had better to draw it (يدنين عليهن من جلابيبهن). It means they had worn jilbab but they had not drawn their jilbab close round them. There for Allah said to who have worn jilbab and who have not worn it exactly: "they had better to drawn their jilbab close around them".

Quraish has held on this opinion at the present time. It is known when he wrote this opinion once in his others book namely Wawasan Al-Quran; Tafsir Tematik atas pelbagai persoalan. He wrote it in special theme about

⁶³ Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir al-Misbah Pesa, Kesan dan Keserasian al-Quran*, Jakarta:Lentera Hati, 2002 p:32

dress. ⁶⁴ Not at all, he also wrote this theme especially on his book by the title "Jilbab Pakaian Wanita Muslimah: Pandangan Ulama Masa Lalu dan Cendekiawan Kontemporer", was published by Pusat Study Quran and Lentera Hati on July 2004. In this controversial book since first publishing, ⁶⁵ Quraish provided some Clasical Islamic Shcolars (*Ulama'*) who said that *jilbab* is Allah commandment to women of believer and some opinion of contemporized scholars whose lax opinion about *jilbab*. He did not prefer to one of both opinion (red_tarjih), because he belief that provide more than one opinion is like give some alternatives that can be received by rightness and give ease for *umat* to do activities those can be received by religion. ⁶⁶ From those difference opinions Quraish concluded that *jilbab* is differentiable problem (*khilafiyyah*) which should not lead accusation each other moreover consider some one infidel or unbeliever.

The Islamic scholar who expert in tafsir and hadits delivered his same opinion once more in the book was published by Lentera Hati by the title "M.Quraish Shihab Menjawab 101 Soal Perempuan" (M. Quraish Shihab answer 101 women problematic). One of problems that answered by him in that book is about *jilbab*. 67

He said that the variety opinions about women dress limit is not certain and not just one opinion. Moreover a student graduated of al-Azhar University said that there is an Islamic scholar who doesn't order women to

⁶⁴ M. Quraish Shihab, Wawasan al-Quran, Bandung:PT.Mizan Pustaka, 2007 p:228

digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id digilib.uinsby.ac.id

 ⁶⁵ It was known when this book was commentated by some Islamic Shcolars on September 26th, 2006. They are Adian Husaini, Dr. Eli Maliki, Dr. Jalaluddin
 66 M. Quraish Shihab. Jilbab Pakaian Wanita Muslimah. Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2004 p:5

M. Quraish Shihab. *Menjawab 101 Problema Perempuan*. Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2004 p.3

cover their whole body. It is enough to wear polite dresses. But, when he was asked to explain "polite dress" completely by hidayatullah.com in launching his new book in Fab Café Gramdia Grand Indonesia, Jakarta Pusat on May 2010 he said: "I am sure with that opinion, but it will take a long times to explain about it. Women are allowed to leave *jilbab*, importantly wear polite dress, but wearing *jilbab* is better.

In Quraish opinion, It was caused al-Quran does not explain the limit of genital cearly. It is known when he interpreted surah an-Nur verse 30-31 that became reference for Islamic Scholars to understand genital. Islamic Shcolars differentiate in interpreting.

"...that they should not display their beauty and ornaments except what (must ordinarily) appear thereof..."

This opinion is absolutely wrong, because what must ordinarily appear is absolutely seen. There are three opinions to correct an opinion above.

First opinion, understanding the word (Y!) as ististna'munqathi' means the exception is not part of the word mentioned before. And the meaning of this verse "they should not display their absolutely ornament, but when they appear unintentionally—such as blow of wind etc.) it is apologized.

Second opinion, insert sentence between piece of verse. It means the verse has about this massage "they (women) should not display their ornament

(their body). They will get sin if do that, but they will be apologized if it appear unintentionally.

Both opinions above did not determine the limit of the appeared ornament; it means the whole body of women must be covered.

Third opinion, interpret the verse "الا ما ظهر" to meaning "usually and or needed to display in order must be appeared". The needed means the difficultness that arisen when part of body must be closed. The majority of Islamic Scholars interpreted the verse with this opinion. Some Hadits are proud this opinion. Such as what was narrated by Abu Dawud;

when a women reaches the age of menstruation, it does not suit her that displays her parts of body except this and this (and he pointed to his face and hand)"

Although they differentiate when interpret "except what must ordinarily appear", but they agree that the whole body of women believers must be cover by wearing *jilbab*, but they differentiate whether face and hand also must be covered.

In interpreting this verse Quraish does not said his opinion clearly. He just provides some opinion of classical opinion then gives commentary. But, in the other hand he also wrote in his Tafsir al-Misbah and some books which discuss about *jilbab* and the dress code of women, some opinion of contemporary Shcolars whose loose opinion about the dress code of women. One of contemporary scholars that excerpted by Quraish is Thahir Ibn Asyur who said that *jilbab* is product of Arabic culture. "This is a teaching that considered Arabian culture, therefore this teaching not allowed to another

nation who do not wear jilbab." ⁶⁸After providing variety opinion about jilbab and the limit of genital, Quraish did not prefer one of them clearly.

But in the last of his discussion he said:

"Memang, kita boleh berkata bahwa yang menutup seluruh badannya kecuali wajah dan (telapak) tangannya, menjalankan bunyi teks ayat itu, bahkan mungkin berlebih. Namun dalam saat yang sama kita tidak wajar menyatakan terhadap mereka yang tidak memakai kerudung, atau yang menampakkan tangannya, bahwa mereka "secara pasti telah melanggar petunjuk agama." Bukankah Al-Quran tidak menyebut batas aurat? Para ulama pun ketika membahasnya berbeda pendapat."

"Well, we can say that who cover whole body except face and hand, has practiced text of this verse, it might more over. But in the same case, we might not say to whom do not wear *jilbab* or open her hand that "they absolutely attack Religion guidance. "Al-Quran did not determine the limit of genital, was it? The Islamic Scholars also differentiate when discuss it."

C. The Similarity and the difference of Both Interpretation About Jilbab

After providing, understanding each of both interpretation, and comparing both of them, it can conclude some similarities and differences:

1. The similarity of Both Interpretation

a) Hamka and Quraish Shihab are Indonesian Interpreters who wrote exegesis work completely 30 parts. In writing their great book, they have same method. They interpreted verse by verse as sequence as the quranic verse. It was started by surah al-Fatihah and finished by surah an-Nas. Then they emphasized discussion of socialization

⁶⁹ Ibid p:333

⁶⁸ Quraish Shihab. *Tafsir al-Misbah*. Jakarta: Lentera Hati. 2002 p:333

- problems and linguistic problem. They discourse quranic exegesis according to sociological and cultural of the Indonesian society.
- b) Both of them interpreted al-Quran according to expert interpreters' opinion or reasoning of themselves. But they did not forget to excerpt the narrations of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) and his companions. They also excerpted some opinions of Islamic Scholars who expert in quranic exegesis.
- c) Both of them in similarity to interpret the meaning of jilbab. Under their opinions jilbab is an outer garment worn by women of believers to cover their body.

2. The difference of Both Interpretation

- a) According to Hamka interpretation *jilbab* order in Surah al-Ahzab verse 59 is God obligation to every woman of believers. Every of them must cover their bodies by wearing jilbab when they go out to fill their needed. In spite of Quraish Shihab interpretation, by Surah al-Ahzab verse 59, God not order the women of believers to wear *jilbab*. It might happen because some of women had worn *jilbab* at that time, on condition that they had not worn it as possible as al-Quran has established. *Jilbab* order is just suggestion and advice to them. It known from his interpretation "they had better to drawn their jilbab close around them". But wearing jilbab is better.
- b) Both of them differentiate to explain the limit of women genital. On

 Hamka interpretation the meaning of "الا ما ظهر منها" is two hands

and face. So that the women must cover their whole bodies, except their face and two hand. But depend on Quraish Shihab interpretation; al-Quran did not determine the limit of women genital clearly. The tradition of Prophet Muhammad and his companions is also debatable in giving information about it. It makes the Islamic Shcolars have difference opinion about it. Therefore it was doubtable and it was caused Quraish said that *jilbab* is *khilafiyyah* problem. So that women might to leave *jilbab*. But the important of them, they must wear polite dresses.