

THE APPROVAL OF THE SUPERVISOR

Thesis by Ida Royani

Has been approved by the Supervisor

Surabaya, July 15th, 2011

Supervisor

Dr. H. Abdul Kadir Riyadi, Lc. M.Sc.
NIP. 197008132005011003

A. Muhammad Shahrur	
1. His Biography and Academic career	30
2. The development of His Thought.....	32
3. His Methodology	33
4. His Works	36
5. His Concept of Polygamy	37
B. Asghar Ali Engineer	
1. His Biography and Scientific Activities.....	40
2. His Methodology	43
3. Beliefs on Women's Rights.....	44
4. His Awards	45
5. His Works	46
6. His Concept of Polygamy	49

A. Muhammad Shahrur's Thought of Polygamy in the Qur'an.....	57
B. Asghar Ali Engineer's Thought of Polygamy in the Qur'an.....	60
C. Shahrur and Asghar's Thoughts of Polygamy in the Qur'an: A Comparative Analysis.....	64

A.	Conclusion	67
B.	Suggestion.....	68

[illegible]

Engineer, can help human to think more widely (deeper) and rational toward the problems that is faced today.

B. Identification and Limitation of the Problem

As being known, polygamy is one of the gender issues, it has become a polemic until now. So that, there are many problems were appeared in this study, they are:

1. How are the view and the opinion of conservative and modern Muslims about polygamy?
2. How are the view and the opinion of conservative and modern Muslims about the verses that explain polygamy?
3. How are the polygamy requirements?

Therefore, to make it more focus and suitable with the theme, this study is limited only in comparative study between Shahrur and Asghar's views about the concept of polygamy in Holy Qur'an chapter al-Nisa' [4]: 3, namely explaining each interpretation to understand that concept. Furthermore, the researcher will explain the similar and difference of their interpretation about that concept.

Shahrur and Asghar connect it to look after the orphans and widows in that verse. In proving it, Shahrur tried to prove it by his *tartil* method with *syntagmatic-paradigmatic* analysis. Meanwhile, in interpreting the verses of the Holy Qur'an (included al-Nisa [4]: 3), he (Asghar) used a hermeneutic approach, a way to build "hierarchy (*hirarkisasi*)" which this way has been

Shahrur and Asghar's views about the concept of polygamy in Holy Qur'an (al-Nisa' [4]: 3).

b. Comparative Method

The writer uses comparison as the method of study. The comparison is to compare the similarity and the difference of both opinion Muhammad Shahrur and Asghar Ali Engineer their exegetical works. The writer compares the similarity and difference of the opinion, the change of human opinion, ideas or events.

c. Content Analysis

In order to get the deeper analysis, objective, factual and systematic about the concept of polygamy, in this study is used the content analysis method. This method need to describe the outline Shahrur and Asghar's views about the concept of polygamy in Holy Qur'an chapter al-Nisa' [4]: 3.¹⁵

I. The Outline of the Thesis

Chapter I: Introduction. This chapter consists of the background of the study, identification and limitation of the problem, the problem of the study, the objective of the study, the definition of key terms, the use of the study, review of literatures, the method of the study, and the outline of the study.

¹⁵ Moh. Nazir, *Metodologi Penelitian*, (Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia, 1988), p. 63.

POLYGAMY: A GENERAL OVERVIEW

A. The Meaning of Polygamy

The word polygamy comes from the Greek. It consists of two words, namely *apolus*, which means many and *gamos*, which means wife or partner. It could be said that polygamy means to have several wives simultaneously.¹⁶ Terminologically in the meantime, polygamy can be understood as a condition in which a husband has more than one wife.¹⁷

According to Fadlurrahman, polygamy is a marriage system from various systems that is known human as monogamy, polyandry, and polygyny, etc.¹⁸ Meanwhile, according to Musdah Mulia, polygamy is marriage's bond who one of the sides (husband) marry several wives simultaneously. It is also known by the term "Polyandry". If in polygamy a husband has several wives. Whereas, polyandry is a wife has several husbands simultaneously. But, if it is compared with polygamy, polyandry is rarely practiced. Polyandry only discovers in certain tribes, such Indian tribal and several tribal in Tibet.¹⁹

¹⁶ Nashruddin Baidan, *Upaya Penggalan Konsep Perempuan dalam al-Qur'an (Mencermati Konsep Kesejajaran Perempuan dalam al-Qur'an)*, Ed. 1, (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 1999), p. 94.

¹⁷ H.A. Rodli Makmun, et.al, *Poligami dalam Tafsir Muhammad Syahrur*, (Ponorogo: STAIN Ponorogo Press. 2009), p. 15.

¹⁸ Fadlurrahman, *Islam Mengangkat Martabat Wanita*, (Gresik: Putra Pelajar, Ed. I, 1999), p. 33.

¹⁹ Musdah Mulia, *Pandangan Islam tentang Poligami*, Ed. 1, (Jakarta: Lembaga Kajian Agama dan Gender, 1999), p.2.

caste is permitted to marry everyone whose he likes without the limitation.²⁶

Also the situation is cultured and institutionalized in Israel societies before the prophet of Moses came. Then the custom of marriage was attempted by Talmud in Jerusalem to be removed. A husband might only marry one woman as possible as his capable in saving and taking care of her well. But, the work apparently failed, due the Kairat did not recognize the limitation.²⁷ While in other tradition, someone who had more than one of wives would be given a prize. The custom was occurred in Persian societies.²⁸

In religion law that is followed by Athens and Roman, there is prohibition for man to have two wives or more at the same time. If man has second wife, his marriage shall be considered in legal law, but the second marriage is considered as divorced the first wife. Therefore, in that period (in Roman) principles prevails freedoms of divorced.²⁹

In pre-Islamic period, i.e. in past Arabia period (Arab Jahiliyyah), the Arabs very disliked women. Women figure were considered as an ignominy, due since children, women was destroyed and buried alive. The Arabs tribes who often degrade the women are tribes of Quraisy and Kinda.³⁰ Also at the time, a husband was freed to have wife without restricting. There was a person who took of ten wives, even up to hundreds. It was done without the

²⁶ Inayah Rahmaniyyah and Moh. Sidik, *Menyoal keadilan dalam Poligami*, Vol. IV, (Yogyakarta: PSW UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2009), p. 43.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 43-44.

²⁸ *Ibid.*

²⁹ Mahmud Syaltut, *Aqidah dan Syari'at Islam*, p. 288.

³⁰ Inayah Rahmaniayah and Moh. Sidik, *Menyoal keadilan dalam Poligami*, p. 45.

thus the child's family held back her waiting for the son became an adult. After becoming an adult, he could choose between marrying his step mother or letting her go.³⁴

3. *Al-Rahthu* marriages (Polyandry), i.e. marriage among several men with women. After having pregnancy and giving birth, she invited all of her husband who was having sex with her to determine whose father for her baby and he could not refuse.
4. *Khadan* marriages, i.e. marriage between men and women quietly without legal marriage contract.³⁵
5. *Badal* marriages, i.e. two husbands who unanimously to barter their wife without divorced before.³⁶
6. *Syighar* marriages, i.e. a man (father) married off his daughter or his sister without give *mahar* (bride price). But with in returning that's man (relationship between whose children were married) also gave his daughter or his sister to him. This marriage was often called by "barter marriages".
7. *Baghaya* marriages, i.e. several man whose had bad behavior alternately having sex with a whore frankly. If she was pregnant and gave birth, the man who having sex with her came together to meet her. Then, she determined whose father for her baby who most like with her baby.

³⁴ Ibnu Katsir, *Tafsir al-Qu'an al-'Azīm*, Juz II, p. 87.

³⁵ Inayah Rahmaniyyah dan Muhammad Sodiq, *Menyoal Keadilan dalam Poligami*, Ed. IV, (Yogyakarta: PSW UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2009), p. 9.

STAIN Ponorogo Press, 2009), p. 34.

Marriage for them only a game, because there is no strict rules which regulating how marriage can be a happy family in life. Such this situation has become foothold for Islam to apply the law construction which can repair state of society, especially in marriage problems and women's right.

C. The Development of the Concept of Polygamy in Islam

In human's history, the developments of polygamous still follow the society's views toward women. While they view the women's status is contemptible, hence polygamy rapidly growing. Otherwise, if they view the women's status is respectable, hence it was reduced. Thus, polygamous developments run into fluctuating follow the high and low of women's status in society's views.³⁹

When Islam came, custom of polygamy was not directly abolished. But, after the verse whose offending polygamy was revealed, then our prophet made radical changes accordingly indication content of the verse. These changes were related to two things: *the first*, restricting the number of wives just up to four. Some narrations (riwayat) were explained the restriction of polygamy, one of them is narration by Naufal ibn Muawiyah, he said: “*When I profess Islam, I have five wives*”. Then our prophet Muhammad said: “*You have to divorce one of them and hold on four of your wives*”.⁴⁰

³⁹ Nasr Hamid Abu Zayd, *Dekonstruksi Gender (translation)*, Published by SAMHA and PSW corporations, (Yogyakarta, 2003).

⁴⁰ Murtadha Muthahhari, *Hak-Hak Wanita dalam Islam*, (Bandung: Lentera, 1997), p. 244.

not cut the relations of) the wombs (kinship) . surely, Allâh is ever an All-Watcher over you”⁴²

The verse above consists of the creation of human being: man and women, that both of them are the creature of God's creation that created from "one soul (*nafs wahidah*)". Because of that, the origin of creation man and woman is same. There is a person who understands one soul (*nafs wahidah*) is Adam as and majority of modern jurists understands in the kind of man and woman, so this verse is same to word of God in chapter al-Hujurat [49]: 13.⁴³ Furthermore, the first verse in that chapter also contain warning in order that human faithful to Allah and maintain fraternal relations among human being.⁴⁴

Then, the second verse as follow:

وَأَتُوا الَّتِي تَمَىٰ أَمْوَالُهُمْ ۖ وَلَا تَتَّبِعُوا الْحَبِيثَ بِالطَّيِّبِ ۖ وَلَا تَأْكُلُوا

أَمْوَالَهُمْ إِلَىٰ أَمْوَالِكُمْ إِنَّهُ كَانَ حُوبًا كَبِيرًا ﴿٢٠﴾

Meaning: *“And give unto orphans their property and do not exchange (your) bad things for (their) good ones; and devour not their substance (by adding it) to Your substance. surely, This is a great sin.”*⁴⁵

This verse is talking about keeping orphans problems in order to do justice to them and contain prohibition to use their property if it just for

⁴² QS. al-Nisa' [4]: 1

⁴³ Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir al-Mishbah*, (Bandung: Mizan, 2000), p. 313.

⁴⁴ Musdah Mulia, *Islam Menggugat Poligami*, p. 88.

⁴⁵ QS. Al-Nisa' [4]: 2

personal importance. Fazlur Rahman says, that in this contents of verse, the The Holy Qur'an complains that many guardians whose misuse the orphan's property and use it fraudulently.⁴⁶

As the answer from two verses before are as follow:

وَإِنْ خِفْتُمْ أَلَّا تُقْسِطُوا فِي الْيَتَامَىٰ فَانكِحُوا مَا طَابَ لَكُمْ مِنَ النِّسَاءِ
مَتًى وَثَلَاثَ وَرَبْعَ ۖ فَإِنْ خِفْتُمْ أَلَّا تَعْدِلُوا فَوَاحِدَةً أَوْ مَا مَلَكَتْ أَيْمَانُكُمْ ۚ ذَلِكَ

Meaning: *“if you fear that you shall not be able to Deal justly with orphans, marry women of your choice, two or three or four; but if you fear that you shall not be able to Deal justly (with them), then only one, or (A captive) that your right hands possess, that will be more suitable, to prevent you from doing injustice”*.⁴⁷

This verse was revealed in Medina after Uhud war. As being known, due of carelessness and indiscipline of Muslims in that war caused them defeated in war. Many Muslim's soldiers passed away in battle field. Then the impact, the number of widows and orphans in that Muslim's community drastically increased. And maintenance responsibility of orphans is certainly devolved to their guardians. Not all of orphans poor. Among them there are inherit a lot of property, the late heritage their parent.⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Abdul Mustaqim. *Konsep Poligami Menurut Muhammad Syahrur, (Jurnal Studi Ilmu-ilmu al-The Holy Qur'an dan Hadis, Vol. 8), p. 48-53.*

⁴⁷ QS. al-Nisa' [4]: 3

⁴⁸ Musdah Mulia, *Islam Menggugat Poligami*, p. 32.

orphans or wives. According to ath-Thabari, from interpretation of this verse, that The Holy Qur'an restricting the number of wives up to four, in order that guardian does not try to misuse orphan's property whose in his charge to finance necessity another wives. If he may not act equitably, hence he has to marry one wife only.⁵⁰

According to Ibn Katsir, polygamy is something allowed in religion and just applies in certain conditions. Because there are argumentations which shows it, i.e. chapter al-Nisa' verse 3 and an example from the messenger Muhammad saw. Though wording in The Holy Qur'an related to polygamy is *Fankihū*, in fi'il *amr* form, but, the meaning of this word is *ibāhah* (permitted) and it is not command who have to be done, such as command to praying, fasting and zakat.

According to the verses of polygamy in the Holy Qur'an. Fazlur Rahman, a noted Islamic scholar who taught at Chicago University, observes:

It cleared from the passage that the Holy Qur'an talking of polygamy in the context to treating orphaned girls who had come of age but to whom their guardians were unwilling to give back their properties. Instead, they would like to marry they ward, so that they could continue those their properties. Otherwise, they would resort to "eating up" their properties, either by exchanging their good ones for bad ones of their own by 'mixing up' properties. Many guardians properties concerning their wards properties

⁵⁰ Asghar Ali Engineer, *Pembebasan Perempuan* (translation), Yogyakarta: ELKiS, 2003), p. 113-114.

(both boy and girls) were a theme the Holy Qur'an addresses recurrently both in Mecca and Medina. It was clear that the first passage provided definite answers: their guardians were allowed to marry them up to four as a lesser evil to their unlawfully consuming their properties, if they were willing to do justice to their properties. The polygamy by made it conditional upon their doing justice among these women and requiring that they marry only one, if you fear cannot to do justice.⁵¹

Command to polygamy, according to Wahbah al-Zuhaili, similarly command to eat and drink, as contained also in The Holy Qur'an *kulū wasyabū*. Besides the meaning of *ibāhah*, another meaning which can be used from *amar* form is *fankihū* (compulsory). The meaning is obligation to do limitation. Because there is connection between a cut of verse with verse whose after that mention the number two, three or four.⁵² However, the basic law of polygamy is permission (*jawāz*) that can be changed become forbidden (*harām*) when someone cannot fulfill the requirements that established for it.

According to Muhammad Abduh, talking about orphans in polygamy problems is not without reason. This gives definition that polygamy problems are identical with orphan's problems.⁵³ Because both problems that there is injustice problems. Orphans had often become victim of injustice

⁵¹ "The status of Women in Islam: A Modernist Interpretation" in Hanna Papanek & Gail Minault, eds., - Separate worlds, *Studies of Purdah in South Asia*, (Delhi, tnp: 1982), p. 229-300.

52 Laili Maziyah, *Pandangan Para Mufasir terhadap Poligami dalam Kesetaraan Gender*, (malang: Jurnal Penelitian Kependidikan, No. 1, October 2008), 110.

⁵³ Muhammad Rasyid Ridla, *Tafsir al-Manar*, Juz V, (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr), p. 346.

due they did not be protected. Meanwhile, in polygamy, whose become victim of injustice are women. In The Holy Qur'an, for example orphans, woman, and slaves are often mentioned as *al-mustadh'afin* (weakened person). Their rights are weak because did not be protected.⁵⁴

Permission of polygamy is something very difficult. Because it weights requirement whose must be fulfilled. Thus, it gives an understanding that God prohibit polygamy. Of course polygamy forbidden for them whose fear that they may not act equitable if marry more than one. If still implemented the contract in that condition, hence the marriage contract *fāsid* (invalid) or forbidden because the prohibition was became obstacle for legal marriage contract.⁵⁵

Following his teacher's opinion, Rasyid Ridla adding the polygamy naturally contradicted with marriage purpose, because of in its principle the marriage is between a man and a woman. Polygamy is only for the emergencies condition and with the strict requirements. Hence, if polygamy causes madharat (harmful) than the benefits, and causes the complex problems in society, thus judges would prohibit polygamy.⁵⁶

Unfortunately, according to Quraish Shihab, the third verse in chapter al-Nisa' is often misunderstood. This verse is revealed as spoken by Aisyah ra about guardians attitude whose want to marry orphans (beautiful face) and rich who in his charge. But, he does not want to give *mahar* (bride

⁵⁴ Musdah Mulia, *Islam Menggugat Poligami*, p. 96.

⁵⁵ Muhammad Rasyid Ridla, *Tafsir al-Manar*, Juz V, (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr), p. 345.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 347.

CHAPTER III

THE BIOGRAPHY OF MUHAMMAD SHAHRUR, ASGHAR ALI ENGINEER AND THEIR THOUGHTS ABOUT THE CONCEPT OF POLYGAMY

A. Muhammad Shahrur

1. His Biography and Academic Career

Shahrur's full name is Muhammad Shahrur Ibn Da'ib Shahrur. He was a contemporary Muslim thinker who was born on April 11th, 1938 in Damascus (Syria). His father was Deyb bin Deyb Shahrur and his mother was Siddiqah binti Salih Filyun.⁵⁹ If it was traced the history of educational background, in the beginning Shahrur did not study Islamic sciences intensively. The evident is, for example, after completing his secondary school level, then he went to the Soviet Union to study engineering in Moscow in 1958. After completing the undergraduate degree, then he returned to Syria in 1964 and worked as a lecturer at the University of Damascus.⁶⁰

In 1967, Shahrur got the opportunity to do research at Imperial College in London England. However there was “the June War” between Syria and Israel that caused diplomatic relations between Syria and England was cut off. Finally, Shahrur decided to go to Dublin, Ireland on behalf of the University of Damascus to take masters programs and

⁵⁹ Ahmad Syarqawi Ismail, *Rekonstruksi Konsep Wahyu Muhammad Shahrur*, (Yogyakarta: eLSAQ Press, 2003), p. 43.

⁶⁰ Peter Clark, *The Shahrur Phenomenon, A Liberal Islamic Voice from Syria*, in *Islam and Christian Moslem Relation*, Vol. 7, No. 3, p. 337.

B. Asghar Ali Engineer

1. His Biography and Scientific Activities

Asghar Ali Engineer was born in Bohra, precisely in Salumbar Rajasthan, India, on March 10, 1939, from couples Sheikh Husain Qunan and Maryam. He obtained his formal education in India, since elementary school, junior and senior college entrance at Vikram University (1956). In 1962 he earned a Bachelor of Civil Engineering (BSc Eng.). In according with his expertise, after college, he had been a civil engineer for long time and doing research on various aspects of Islam.⁸⁸

The success will become an Islamic thinker; it does not depart from formal education. Family background is devout followers of *Syi'ah Ismailiyyah* flow shaping it into a highly concentrated on religious teachings. His father who is a Shiite cleric, taught him Arabic and the various treasures of Islamic thought, classical and modern. In addition to mastering the Arabic language very well, he himself was able to master the language of Urdu, Persian and English as well. Mastery of language will vary is what pushed him to explore a variety of original works of religious, both derived from the Muslim and non-Muslims.⁸⁹

Besides he was active writer, either in the form of articles in journals and book form, Asghar also an active figure in the social

⁸⁸ Nasihun Amin, *Teologi Pembebasan Islam sebagai Alternatif: Telaah terhadap Pemikiran Asghar Ali Asghar*, the Thesis in Pascasarjana Program of IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, p. 50-57.

⁸⁹ Asghar Ali Asghar, "What I Believe", in *Jurnal Islam and Modern Age*, 7/2 (1999), p. 2.

Perspective and the other journals published by the Center for the Study of Society and Secularism.⁹¹

2. His Methodology

In the context of his Islamic thinking, Asghar focused more on issues of liberation theology that provided theoretical framework in spreading religious thought to the Muslims.⁹²

For that, Asghar offered thoughts, philosophy and hermeneutics to understand the verses in the Qur'an that the color of "liberation theology" of him is very thick. However his effort was often protested from the older generation, Asghar always advocated not only the formulation of "transformative theology" as well as offered by Hassan Hanafi of Egypt who wrote *Revelation and Revolution in Islam*. Moreover, Asghar also "provoked" younger generation to reconstruct the "theology of radical transformative". When the idea of liberation theology emerged among churches in Latin America, Asghar "imported" it by writing about the "liberation theology in Islam".⁹³

This liberation theology which is became the central issue of Asghar's writing. On this relation, he attempted to break the ice of conventional theological that only related metaphysics and ritualism issues while ignoring many contemporary problems. Instead, Asghar focused forward his ideas on the issue of egalitarianism, which was

⁹¹ Nasihun Amin, *Teologi Pembebasan...*, p. 53.

⁹² Djohan Effendi, "Memikirkan Kembali Asumsi Pemikiran Kita", p. vii.

⁹³ *Ibid.*

3. Beliefs on Women's Rights

Asghar believes that in this day and age women should be equal to men. “Women had internalized their subjugation of men as the latter were the breadwinners. Since then women have become quite conscious of their new status”.⁹⁵ Women are sometimes the “breadwinners” of the household while the man stays home, now. In the past it would be inconceivable to think that a woman was allowed out of the house, but now they are an active earning member of the family even in places like Saudi Arabia.⁹⁶ Women have now been Prime Ministers, even against opposing views. However, women are not treated totally equally in all Muslim establishments, and that is what Engineer is fighting to change. He wants to see equality across the board, considering the present time.

⁹⁶ *Ibid.* p. viii.

4. His Awards

He has been awarded several awards, including the Dalmia Award for communal harmony in 1990, honorary D.Litt. by the University of Calcutta in 1993, the 'Communal Harmony Award' in 1997 and the Right Livelihood Award in 2004 (with Swami Agnivesh) for his strong commitment to promote values of co-existence and tolerance.⁹⁸

5. Asghar Ali Engineer's Works

- *Origin and Development of Islam: An Essay on Its Socio-Economic Growth.* , by Asghar Ali Engineer, Asghar Ali Engineer Staff. Published by South Asia Books, 1980. ISBN 0-8364-0590-0.
- *The Islamic State.* Published by Vikas, 1980. ISBN 0-7069-1086-9.
- Sufism and Communal Harmony
- *Islam and Its Relevance to Our Age.* Published by Institute of Islamic Studies, 1984.
- *On developing theory of communal riots.* Published by Institute of Islamic Studies, 1984.
- *Islam and Revolution.* Published by Ajanta Publications, 1984.
- *Islam and Muslims: a critical reassessment.* Published by Printwell Publishers, 1985.
- *Islam in South and South-east Asia.* Published by Ajanta Publications, 1985. ISBN 81-202-0152-3.

⁹⁸ Nasihun Amin, *Teologi Pembebasan*, p. 53. And see [http://www.csss-
isla.com/csssteam.htm](http://www.csss-
isla.com/csssteam.htm)

- *Indian Muslims: A Study of Minority Problems in India*. Published by Ajanta Publications (India), 1985.
- *Communalism in India*, by Asgharali Asghar, Moin Shakir. Published by Ajanta Publications (India), 1985. ISBN 81-202-0153-1.
- *The Role of minorities in freedom struggle*. Institute of Islamic Studies (Bombay, India). Published by Ajanta Publications, 1986.
- *Ethnic conflict in South Asia*. Published by Ajanta Publications, 1987.
- *Status of women in Islam*. Published by Ajanta Publications (India), 1987. ISBN 81-202-0190-6.
- *The Shah Bano controversy*, Orient Longman, 1987. ISBN 0-86131-701-7.
- *The Muslim communities of Gujarat: an exploratory study of Bohras, Khojas, and Memons*. Published by Ajanta Publications, 1989. ISBN 81-202-0220-1.
- *Religion and Liberation*. Published by Ajanta Publications (India), 1989. ISBN 81-202-0264-3.
- *Communalism and communal violence in India: an analytical approach to Hindu-Muslim conflict*. Published by Ajanta Publications (India), 1989.
- *Communal Riots in Post-independence India*. Published by Orient Blackswan, 1991. ISBN 81-7370-102-4.

- *Secular crown on fire: the Kashmir problem*. Published by Ajanta Publications, 1991. ISBN 81-202-0311-9.
- *Mandal Commission controversy*. Published by Ajanta Publications, 1991. ISBN 81-202-0312-7.
- *Rights of Women in Islam*. Sterling Publishers, 1992.
- *Communalisation of politics and 10th Lok Sabha elections*, by Asghar Ali Engineer, Pradeep Nayak. Published by Ajanta Publications, 1993.
- *The Bohras*. South Asia Books, 1994. ISBN 0-7069-7345-3.
- *Kerala Muslims: a historical perspective*. Published by Ajanta Publications, 1995.
- *Lifting the veil: communal violence and communal harmony in contemporary India*. Sangam Books, 1995. ISBN 81-7370-040-0,.
- *Problems of Muslim Women in India*. Published by Institute of Islamic Studies, 1995.
- *Rethinking Issues in Islam*. Sangam Books Limited, 1998. ISBN 0863117686.
- *Competing nationalisms in South Asia: essays for Asghar Ali Engineer*, by Paul R. Brass, Achin Vanaik, Asghar Ali Engineer. Published by Orient Blackswan, 2002. ISBN 812502221X.
- *Islam in India: The Impact of Civilizations*. Shipra Publications, 2002. ISBN 8175411155.

permitted polygamy most reluctantly in certain conditions like that of war and has made it conditional on justice.

Our 'ulama and jurists unfortunately have ignored both the conditions (that of war and of justice) and give reasons for polygamy, not stated in Qur'an at all. Sexual corruption is nowhere stated in Qur'an for justifying polygamy as our 'ulama are doing today. Many of them are not even aware of verse 4:129 which says it is so difficult to do justice between all the wives or if they are aware explain it away in some ways belittling its emphasis on justice.

Some of the ‘ulama even denied that this verse was revealed after the battle of Uhud and also maintained that the verse 4:3 does not require that one should marry widows or orphans only citing a hadith from Muslim which says Hadrat ‘Aisha understood by that ‘any women’, not widows and orphans. If the Qur’an had meant any women it would require insertion of certain words which are not there.

And even if this report of *Sahih Muslim* be correct, how can one ignore the conditionality of justice which is stated so clearly and with so much emphasis? One Muslim scientist wrote to me that Qur'an prescribes polygamy because man is polygamous by nature. He, in his letter, argued elaborately but without substantiating his argument with any scientific evidence.

The Qur'an, on the other hand, clearly says that We have created everything in pairs (*wa khalāqnākum azwājan*) and it includes human

THE CONCEPT OF POLYGAMY IN MUHAMMAD SHAHRUR'S AND ASGHAR ALI ENGINEER'S THOUGHT: COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

In his attempt to understand the Qur'anic verse in chapter al-Nisa' [4]: 3, which speaks about the permissibility of polygamy, Shahrur sets himself out to analyse it from linguistic terms using in that regard the semantic approach. This means that no matter how rational Sharur has become, he will remain loyal to the *bayani* epistemology (explanatory), which he always employs in his understanding of divine text. *Bayani* epistemology is an episteme in which a reading of divine text begins from the text (*nash*) itself. So, the role of the text here remains very strong and in this case he still considers the text (the Qur'an) sacred. In applying the methodology of his interpretation, he always sets out from the text analysis, in which he parses the semantic aspects, language philosophy, including the systematic-paradigmatic analysis and historical analysis.

¹¹⁰ He is a contemporary muslims thinker of Indonesia who took masters and doctor programs from al-Azhar Universities of Kairo, with study the Qur'an and Hadith. He was wrote a number of books and articles especially in field *tafsir* and religion social problems. He ever

collecting all or some of the verses of some chapters that speaks about related topic then it's linked to another, therefore, ultimately the conclusions of the matter is drawn entirely according to the views of the Qur'an.¹¹¹

Tahlili method concluded that the text of the verse mentioned above allow polygamy; a man may marry more than one to four with the condition can be fair. However with the *maudhu'i* method, it may be concluded different with the other verses that seemed to exclude fair condition for humans. The verses are:

"Ye are never able to be fair and just As between women, Even if it is your ardent desire: but turn not away (from a woman) altogether, so As to leave Her (as it were) hanging (in the air). if ye come to a friendly understanding, and practise self-restraint, Allah is Oft-forgiving, Most Merciful".¹¹²

This verse can be interpreted polygamy rejecting, or at least tighten the implementation of polygamy. The terms of polygamy are the ability to be fair, while this verse confirms a person's inability to do justice among his wives. The word “*but turn not away (from a woman) altogether*” in the verse as if addressed to those who cannot afford to be fair, while for those who are able to do justice on its own piece of this verse shall not be valid.

The first verse had been inspired earlier after Uhud war while Muslims was suffering defeat. In such an atmosphere of war, it is certain

became a rector in IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, and ambassador in Saudi Arabia, since 1999.

¹¹Ouraish Shihab, *Membumikan Al-Qur'an*, (Bandung: Mizan, 1992), p. 14.

¹¹² OS. al-Nisa' [4]: 129

of widows and orphans in the Muslim community. Taking the opinion of Maulana Muhammad Ali, Asghar said that the main emphasis in verse polygamy is to do justice to women, especially widows and orphans. The permissibility of polygamy should be viewed strictly in the context of the prevailing circumstances so that even if conditions allow polygamy, the man is still expected to be monogamy if unable to do justice. He further concluded that the Qur'an teaches monogamy as normative doctrine, while polygamy is the teachings of the Qur'an that are contextual. Unfortunately, still according to Asghar, the permission which is very limited was understood widely as the general permission and can be done in any circumstances.¹¹⁹

This analysis is in line with Muhammad Shahrur thought, a Syrian Muslim intellectuals, who said that the clause which allows man to marry (until) four wives has restrictions, rather than easing as commonly understood, so that in the category of *hadd al-A'lā* or maximum limit. Instead, the verses talked about the inheritance of women have the opposite movement so half of the male heirs are al-*hadd al-adnā* or minimums.

According to the researchers in understanding the verses of polygamy, both scholars have similarity besides using the Qur'an chapter al-Nisa' [4]: 3 as the argument to strengthen his opinion, also has strict requirements for men who want to practice polygamy and even then under certain conditions.

¹¹⁹ Asghar Ali Engineer, *Hak-hak Perempuan dalam Islam*, p. 221-223.

The researchers also looked at both scholars were more likely to use the semantic method (*maudhu'i*), but they depart from their respective methods of thinking. Sharurs with his *tartil* method applies his limits theory, and Asghar offers his hermeneutic methods by using several approaches, such as historical, sociological, anthropological and philosophical. He also does not forget because of the verse revelation (*asbāb al-nuzūl*) are intimately associated with polygamy permission. They also have the same conclusion which is basically the verse taught to perform a monogamous marriage if unable to do justice. Polygamy is not really a purpose (*ghōyah*), but only a means (*wasīlah*) to provide a solution to a social problem.

The difference here Asghar prioritize normative verse rather than contextual verse, however, he does not condone polygamy when a person is unable to meet the specified requirements. While Shahrur, although he argued that the Qur'an follow the principle of monogamy and create strict requirements for those who want to practice polygamy, but there is something quite fundamental in his view. He considers that polygamy is not merely permissible, even its suggestion (command), if the terms of polygamy can be properly fulfilled.

CLOSING

From the description in advance about the concept of polygamy according to Muhammad Shahrur and Asghar Ali Engineer: the comparative study can be concluded as follow:

- 66

[illegible]

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Amin, Nashihun. Without year. *Teologi Pembebasan Islam sebagai Alternatif: Telaah terhadap Pemikiran Asghar Ali Asghar*. Yogyakarta: Pascasarjana Program of IAIN Sunan Kalijaga.
- Baidan, Nashruddin. 1999. *Upaya Penggalan Konsep Perempuan dalam al-Qur'an (Mencermati Konsep Kesejajaran Perempuan dalam al-Qur'an)*. Ed. 1. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Clark, Peter. Without year. *The Shahrur Phenomenon, A Liberal Islamic Voice from Syria*. In *Islam and Christian Moslem Relation*. Vol. 7. No. 3.
- Darnela, Linda. *Menggali Teks, Meninggalkan Makna: Pemikiran Singkat Muhammad Syahrur Tentang Poligami*. In *jurnal asy-Syir'ah*. Vol. 42. No. 1. 2008.
- Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan RI. 1994. *Kamus Besar Indonesia*. Ed. 3. Jakarta: Balai Pustaka.
- Effendi, Djohan. 1993. "Memikirkan Kembali Asumsi Pemikiran Kita". the preamble to Asghar Ali Asghar, *Islam dan Pembebasan*. Translated by Hairus Salim HS and Imam Baehaqi. Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- El-Alami, Dawoud and Doreen Hinchliffe. 1996. *Islamic Marriage and Divorce Laws of The Arab World*. London. The Hague. Boston: Kluwer Law International.

Manser, Martin.H. 1995. *Oxford learner's pocket dictionary*. Oxford University Press.

Maziyah, Laili. *Pandangan Para Mufasir terhadap Poligami dalam Kesetaraan Gender*. Malang: Jurnal Penelitian Kependidikan. No. 1. October 2008.

Mochtar, Muhammad Zakaria. 2006. Ahwal al-Syakhsyah. *Poligami dalam Perspektif Muhammad Abduh dan Muhammad Syahrur*.

MS, Burhani and Hasbi Lawrens. Without year. *Kamus Ilmiah Populer; Edisi Millenium*. Jombang: Lintas Media.

Mulia, Musdah. 1999. *Pandangan Islam tentang Poligami*. Ed. 1. Jakarta: Lembaga Kajian Agama dan Gender.

_____, Musdah. 2004. *Islam Menggugat Poligami*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia.

Mustaqim, Abdul. 2003. *Mempertimbangkan Metodologi Muhammad Shahrur*. in Shohiron Syamsuddin, et.a. (ed). 2003. *Hermeneutika al-Qur'an Mazhab Yogy*. Yogyakarta: Islamika

_____, Abdul. *Konsep Poligami Menurut Muhammad Syahrur, (Jurnal Studi Ilmu-ilmu al-Holy Qur'an dan Hadis*, Vol. 8, January 2007.

Muthahhari, Murtadha. 1997. *Hak-Hak Wanita dalam Islam*. Bandung: Lentera.

MZ., Labib. 1986. *Pembelaan Ummat Muhammad*. Surabaya: Bintang Pelajar.

Nasution, Khoiruddin. *Perdebatan sekitar Status Poligami*. Jurnal Musawa. No. 1. Vol. 1. March 2002.

Nazir, Moh. 1998. *Metodologi Penelitian*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.

Nurohmah, Leli. *Poligami, Saatnya Melihat Realitas, dalam Menimbang Poligami*, (Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 31, 2003.

- Partanto, Pius A and M. Dahlan Al-Barry. 1994. *Kamus Ilmiah Populer*. Surabaya: Arkola.
- Qardhawi, Muhammad Yusuf. Without year. *Halal dan Haram dalam Islam*. Translated by Muammal Hamidy. Surabaya: PT Bina Ilmu.
- Rahman, Fazlur. 1999. *Islam Mengangkat Martabat Wanita*. Ed. 1. Gresik: Putra Pelajar.
- Rahmaniyah, Inayah and Moh. Sidik. 2009. *Menyoal keadilan dalam Poligami*, Ed. IV. Yogyakarta: PSW UIN Sunan Kalijaga.
- _____, Inayah and Moh. Sidik. 2009. *Menyoal keadilan dalam Poligami*. Vol. IV. Yogyakarta: PSW UIN Sunan Kalijaga.
- Ridla, Muhammad Rasyid. Without year. *Tafsir al-Manar*. Juz V. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.
- Shahih al-Bukhari, Juz V
- Shahrur, Muhammad. 1991. *al-Kitab wa al-Qur'an: Qira'ah Mu'ashirah*. Damaskus al-Ahali li al-Thiba'ah wa al-Nashr wa al-Tamzi'.
- _____, Muhammad. 2000. *Nahwa Ushul Jadidah lil Fiqhi al-Islami: Fiqh al-Mar'ah, al-Washiyyah, al-Irts, al-Qiwamah, al-Ta'addudiyyah, al-Libas*. Damaskus: al-Ahali li ath-Thiba'ah wa al-Nasyr wa al-Tauzi'.
- _____, Muhammad. 2004. *Dasar-dasar Hermeneutika al-Qur'an Kontemporer*. Translated by Sahiron Syamsuddin, et.al. Yogyakarta: eLSAQ Press.
- _____, Muhammad. 2007. *Metodologi Fikih Islam Kontemporer*. Translated by: Sahiron Syamsuddin. Yogyakarta: Elsaq Press.
- Shihab, Quraish. 1992. *Membumikan Al-Qur'an*. Bandung: Mizan.

- _____, Quraish. 2000. *Tafsir al-Mishbah*. Bandung: Mizan.
- Sumiati. Without year. *Hukum Pernikahan Islam dan Undang-undang Pernikahan*. Yogyakarta: Liberti.
- Syaltut, Mahmud. Without year. *Aqidah dan Syari'at Islam*. Translated by Fachruddin HS and Nashruddin Thaha. tp.: Bumi Aksara.
- Syawwaf, Muhami Munir Muhammad Tahir al-. 1993. *Tahafut al-Qira'ah al-Mu'ashirah*. Ed. 1. Limmasol Cyprus: al-Syawwaf li al-Nasyr.
- Syuqqah, Abdul Halim Abu. 1990. *Kebebasan Perempuan*. Translated by Chairul Halim. Jakarta: Gema Insani Press.
- Tibi, Bassam. 1996. "Moralitas Internasional sebagai Suatu Landasan Lintas Budaya", in M. Nasir Tamara and Elza Peldi Taher (eds). *Agama dan Dialog Antar Peradaban*. Jakarta: Yayasan Wakaf Paramadina.
- Ulfah, Yuni Maria. 2006. Ahwal al-Syakhsyah. *Studi Analisis terhadap Pemikiran Muhammad Syahrur tentang Poligami*.
- Watt, W. Montgomery. 1990. *Islamic Political Thought*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Zayd, Nasr Hamid Abu. 2003. *Dekonstruksi Gender (translation)*. Published by SAMHA and PSW corporations. Yogyakarta.